

Dynamics of Collaboration as an Effort to Develop a Sustainable Tourism Village: The perspective of Tri Hita Karana in Sangeh Tourism Village, Badung Regency

Ni Luh Yulyana Dewi^{1*}, Bambang Supriyono², Andy Fefta Wijaya³, Siti Rochmah⁴

¹*Student of Doctoral Program of Administration Science. Universitas Brawijaya, 65153, Malang, Jawa Timur, Indonesia; Email: niluhyulanadewi@gmail.com*

^{2,3,4}*Lecturer of Faculty of Administration Science. Universitas Brawijaya, 65153, Malang, Jawa Timur, Indonesia,*

Abstracts: The development of the tourism sector, especially the tourist village development, should collaborate synergically with various stakeholders. The tourism industry sometimes cannot play the economic role well because many stakeholders do not have good communication among important elements. The synchronization of various tourism sectors is the foundation to achieve tourism development. The purpose of this study is to analyze the dynamics of *collaborative governance* as an effort to develop a sustainable tourism village from the perspective of Tri Hita Karana. This study used a descriptive qualitative approach. In real life, the researcher collected data by using techniques of observation, interviews, and document studies. The results of this study indicate that Sangeh tourism village development has involved the local community to support their economy. Sustainability mean does not only consider environmental issues or problems but also economic, social, cultural, quality, health, safety, and aesthetic issues which are interrelated with people's social conditions, like culture and customs stated in the philosophy of Tri Hita Karana.

Keywords: Collaboration, Sustainable Tourism, Tri Hita Karana, Collaborative Governance, Local Community

1. INTRODUCTION

Currently, the tourism sector has always been an attraction for anyone to visit a country. Various tourist destinations still become an interesting choice for visitors. Therefore, every country is intensively developing its tourist destination to support the local economy. Every year, the tourism sector is increasingly showing positive developments, so it can attract visitors to come. The increasing number of tourist visits can become a trend and grow fast, so the government can focus on developing sustainable tourism through the development of tourist villages.

A tourist destination in Badung Regency has potential tourism with various uniqueness, such as: the richness of rice fields, forests, rivers, culture, history, culinary and tourist attractions of various nature areas. One of the potential tourism developments in Badung Regency is a tourist village that is supported by cultural values with maintainable beautiful natural panoramas, fresh air, and various endemic ora and fauna well known as Sangeh Tourism Village. It is one of the most popular tourist destinations in Badung Regency. Some potential sectors are not only agriculture, plantations, forestry, and animal husbandry, but also other developing tourism sectors that give a village growth contribution. This is supported by the existence of a nutmeg forest where hundreds of monkeys live in the Sangeh Village area. That's why it becomes a tourist attraction. Besides, Sangeh Tourism Village already has a Bukit Sari Tourism Awareness Group and the management of the Sangeh tourist attraction has been managed directly by Sangeh Custom Village. The group of community in Sangeh Tourism Village has well managed various potentials and made it into business fields. To develop the Sangeh Tourism Village, the Badung Regency government has regulated tourism development. The aim is as a guideline in planning local tourism development to develop existing tourism potential. As a result, the local economy will increase. In developing

Sangeh Tourism Village, people need some efforts and innovation to maintain their cultural wisdom and intensify coordination between people and stakeholders to create the best and most independent tourism village. Tourism activities are inseparable from the participation of the government, both the central government and local governments. They have to be responsible for regional planning or tourism areas, the development of main tourism supporting facilities, tourism policies, and enforcing regulations.

The development of the tourism sector, especially the tourist village development, should collaborate synergically with various stakeholders. The tourism industry sometimes cannot play the economic role well because many stakeholders do not have good communication among important elements. The synchronization of various tourism sectors is the foundation to achieve tourism development. Ministerial Regulation (Permen) of Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia Number 14 of 2016 concerning Guidelines for Sustainable Tourism Destinations states that for tourism to provide benefits to the community and the environment, there need system interconnection, subsystems, sectors, and also dimensions. So that, Tourism Village will be optimally integrated through the roles of business, government, community, academic, and media.

The process of developing the Sangeh Tourism Village needs collaborative governance as a basic alternative way to actualize acceleration in the implementation of sustainable tourism development. Hence, they can use collaborative governance as a new paradigm in dealing with various issues in a complex society, so that needs equal relations between stakeholders in the public sector. To maintain relationship stability with the community, the government plays a role as a cooling system. The government must be ready for all changes, including adopting changes to be applied in providing services or making a policy ([6]; [24]; [25]). In this case, people expected the government to be able to produce relevant and beneficial decisions for society. In responding to massive changes, the government's response is tested so that it can adapt more quickly and move dynamically for the development of tourism villages in the regions ([7]; [8]; [29]; [30]).

In this case, the government has a strong capacity in managing the dynamics of collaboration and successfully performed its principles role. Weak collaboration happened because of the lack of intensive communication among stakeholders. Each stakeholder has a different and limited perspective in developing a tourism village because there are very complex issues that require large resources. Therefore, this paper tries to analyze the dynamics of collaborative governance as an effort to develop a sustainable tourism village from the perspective of Tri Hita Karana.

2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

This research was conducted in Sangeh Tourism Village, Badung Regency a tourist attraction managed by the Sangeh Traditional Village. The types of data used are primary data and secondary data. This study used a descriptive qualitative approach. In the research field, researchers collected data using various techniques, like observation, interviews, and document studies.

Checking the data validity used four criteria consisting of the standard of credibility, dependability, transformability, and confirmability [20]. After collecting data, the researcher analyzes qualitative data interactively and continuously until saturated data is completed.

Miles *et al.*, (2014) explained that there are four activities in data analysis of interactive models, namely data collection, data condensation, data display, and drawing/verifying that researchers must carry out continuously and repeatedly. After collecting and analyzing data, the next step is concluding and verifying the data display. Based on the presentation of the data analysis, there is a theoretical implication recommendation in the dynamics of collaborative development of sustainable tourism villages based on the Tri Hita Karana perspective.

3. RESULTS

The establishment of the Sangeh Tourism Village by Badung Regency is a smart and strategic step, because it departs from the logic of development based on preserving tourism resources. By instilling agrarian culture as the foundation for creative tourism, it implies the spirit of "think globally, act locally". It is realized that the implementation of tourism requires the existence of global standards that become a reference for stakeholders in tourist attractions, in order to guarantee certainty regarding quality standards that will make tourists feel safe.

The establishment of the Sangeh Tourism Village in Badung Regency uses two approaches, namely community-based tourism development and sustainable tourism development. In its journey, the development of tourist villages with a community-based tourism development approach focuses on improving community welfare. Tourism activities that are owned, operated, managed and coordinated by the community, namely the community. To empower the community, several stages are required, including: 1) advancing the community's standard of living while preserving the regional identity. 2) increase the level of economic income while distributing it evenly to the local population. 3) oriented towards developing small and medium scale businesses with large energy absorption capacity and oriented towards appropriate technology. 4) develop a competitive and cooperative spirit. 5) make optimal use of tourism as an agent contributing to cultural traditions with minimal impact. Meanwhile, in sustainable tourism development, the main focus is cooperation between tourists and the community, and community needs in tourism management planning. Don't let the negative impact of tourism activities damage the social and cultural life of the community, because the experience gained by tourists is unique to the pattern of the social and cultural life of the community.

Sangeh Tourism Village as one of the tourist destinations in Badung Regency has various developing potential tourist places. Some potential places, such as: 1) Natural Potential consists of flora and fauna, types of nutmeg trees, and the presence of protected animals like gray monkeys; 2) Cultural Potential of a majority Hindu community strongly believe that nature is one of the elements in the Tri Hita Karana. It means that humans should maintain the environment harmoniously, such as a relationship between natural elements like land, air, plants, and animals. In the Tri Hita Karana universe system, there are three harmonious relationships between God, humans, and the natural environment.

Hindu communities in Bali highly respected in customary norms which are very strongly binding on the behavior and actions of individuals written in a *wig-a wig or perm* (traditional village rules). In addition, there is a religious norm in Hindu Religious Library used as a truth and social teachings guideline as contained in the concept of Tri Kaya Parisuda (three things that are purified) and the concept of Tat Twam Asi (I am you and you are me) means that everyone should love each other. In daily life, the people of Sangeh Village directly implemented those concepts to keep the integrity, kinship, cooperation, and preservation of the nature of the Sangeh forest. As the language "aget", which means always being grateful, a relationship with God, "ngajeng dumun" means always sharing/maintaining a good human relationship, and "tenget" means haunted or relationship with environmental preservation. 3) The management of human resources potential in Sangeh Village has been officially stated through the Decree of the Appointment of Management Board included in the Sangeh custom Village, namely Br. Batusari, Bro. Brahmin, Br. Sibang, Bro. Pemijian, and Br. Muluk Babi. Every 5 (five) years, they renew the employee's contracts and evaluate the employees performance. The Sangeh tourism village is managed by a traditional village. 4) The Spiritual Potential in the Sangeh Tourism Village has 5 (five) temples, namely Bukit Sari Temple, Melanting Temple, Tirtha Temple, Anyar Temple, and Pengepelan Temple (Lanang Wadon) as well as the presence of other spiritual powers.

To support collaboration in the development of the Sangeh Tourism Village, the local government has direct involvement between the Badung Regency and society including managers, actors/providers of tourism services, and academics from various universities in Denpasar City and the District Badung. Other stakeholders who are indirectly involved include Forkom Dewi (Tourism Village Communication Forum) Badung Regency and private parties including ASITA. Currently, leadership factors affect cooperation in society, so it makes managers and service providers still rely on a leader figure as a role model in activities and policy making. Therefore, the role of

stakeholders is really needed to collaborate in the development of the Sangeh Tourism Village so that it can be managed well so that it can produce an impact to create feedback that can be adapted in the collaboration process by creating collaborative success in managing the development of the Sangeh Tourism Village which is in line with what is stated in stated by DeSeve in (Mutirawati & Sudarmo, 2017) which consists of:

1) Network Structure Type:

In the collaboration process, network elements must not form a hierarchy, namely the existence of power from one party, but in the collaboration process, the network must be organic with the network structure involved, namely there is no hierarchy of power, domination and monopoly. So, all parties have equal rights, obligations, responsibilities, authority and opportunities for accessibility in achieving common goals.

2) Commitment to Common Goals

The collaboration that exists does not only benefit one party. However, there must be a commitment that exists with all stakeholders so that the collaboration process must be based on mutual interests and finding joint solutions in dealing with any problems that arise.

3) Stakeholder Trust

Each collaborating stakeholder trusts each other because it is a form of professional relationship that exists to achieve success in implementing the collaboration process.

4) Governance

There are rules that are mutually agreed upon by all stakeholders, as well as freedom to determine how collaboration can be carried out.

5) Access to Power

There are clear authority rules that are accepted by stakeholders to carry out their roles according to their authority.

6) Share Responsibilities

In the collaboration process there must be a clear division of responsibilities, and each stakeholder (including the community) must be involved in making policy decisions.

7) Information Sharing

In the collaboration process there must be clear information sharing, and easy access to information for each stakeholder.

8) Access to Resources

There must be clarity and availability of resources for each stakeholder involved.

4. IMPLICATIONS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1 Theoretical Implications

The theoretical implication of this study referred to the development of new concepts taken from field data and the strengthening or updating of existing theoretical concepts. Some of the theoretical implications are related to collaborative governance theory and the Tri Hita Karana perspective on sustainable tourism.

4.2 Theoretical Implications in Collaborative Governance Theory

Collaboration is a process to see a problem from different perspectives and seek further solutions from possible views. It is a mutually beneficial relationship between two or more parties who work together in sharing responsibility, authority, and accountability to achieve results and goals. As a government arrangement, more public institutions are directly involved with non-governmental stakeholders in a formal, consensus-oriented, and deliberative collective decision-making process. The aims are to implement public policies or manage program policies and manage an asset.

To achieve a goal, the process and structure of public policy decision-making and management involve people constructively across the boundaries of public institutions, levels of government, and/or the public, private, and

civil sectors. Iterative processes strengthen the concept of a collaborative governance regime. The principles include involvement (communication), sharing of motivation (trust, commitment, and mutuality), and capacity for collective action (administration) to reinforce relationships with one another to improve the quality and dynamics of collaboration in positive feedback.

According to Ansell and Gash explained that the new strategy of governance is called collaborative governance. A form of governance that involves various stakeholders simultaneously in a forum with government officials to make joint decisions [2]. Ansell and Gash explained that collaborative governance is a governance arrangement in which one or more public institutions directly involve non-governmental stakeholders in a formal, consensus-oriented, deliberative collective decision-making process that aims to make and implement public policies and manage programs or public assets [3].

As explained by O'Flynn and Wanna, (2008), conceptually there is no real commitment to collaboration because collaboration is seen only as an available tool or instrument. Meanwhile, Wanna explained that collaboration can emphasize the descriptive or pragmatic side which focuses on the reality of solving public problems by involving other stakeholders outside government organizations and on the normative side it emphasizes participativeness and trust in collaboration.

The government's presence through various policy become an important matter for tourism place as the main sector in raising people's standard of living especially local people in tourism development villages. Through the tourism paradigm, a tourist village is part of a tourist destination within one or more administrative areas, such as tourist attractions, public facilities, tourism facilities, accessibility, and communities that are managed properly and completed each other. From several aspects, the collaboration between local government and the community has a good impact on tourism development. It is a priority in terms of sustainable development village.

To support this process, collaborative governance can be an alternative to assist the development of tourist villages with various processes as well as the structure of the public policy, decision-making, and its management involving constructive people within the limits of public institutions, levels of government and society, private and civil society to carry out many interests and cannot be done by only one side [11].

The collaborative governance concept is a transformative nature process that starts from a collaboration between the government and other stakeholders by a nature command. At this stage, the government has strong control and other stakeholders cannot involve in decision-making (hierarchy). Next, the coordination of the government and other stakeholders has taken a decision-making process with a collective nature, and then it has increased to a cooperative relationship. This cooperative relationship shares ideas and resources to get mutual benefits. Finally, a collaborative relationship has occurred to the stage of sharing creations that are tangible in the form of institutions with a permanent and autonomous nature.

In this collaborative relationship, various stakeholders participate in carrying out the collaboration process to develop tourism villages. All stakeholders have rights in decision-making in a part of the joint meeting for deliberation and consensus. As a first step, stakeholder involvement in developing a tourist village can be done by identifying the hopes, motives, intentions and interests desired in the project position. This identification is useful in determining whose interests should be prioritized and used as a determinant in decision making. After the identification process is complete, an assessment can be carried out on stakeholders who are considered more important. There are three tools that can be used as a basis for assessment (Mattessich & Monsey, 1992), namely: 1) Power is the ownership of resources or abilities possessed by stakeholders. 2) Legitimacy is social recognition that is formed because stakeholder behavior is in accordance with the norm system in society. 3) Urgency is a vulnerable or significant time claim that demands immediate attention. Thus, the role of stakeholders is very necessary in the collaboration process. The model stages and processes of collaborative governance start from the (starting conditions) and regulate the basic levels of trust, conflict, and social models. Those become resources or obligations during collaboration. Second, facilitative leadership provides mediation processes and facilities for

collaborative processes. Third, institutional design is defined when collaboration happens. Finally, the collaboration process was carried out in the following stages; 1). face-to-face dialogue; 2). (trust building); 3). (commitment to the process); 4). (shared understanding); and 5). Intermediate outcomes [2].

4.3 Theoretical Implications in the Tri Hita Karana Perspective on Sustainable Tourism

As one of the local wisdom of the Balinese, *Tri Hita Karana* is used as a concept of sustainable tourism development. For most Hindu-Balinese people, the concept of *Tri Hita Karana* has become a guideline in their daily lives. In practice, *Tri Hita Karana* is not only a religious philosophy but also a concept that contains universal values [26]. In a long journey, the elements of *Tri Hita Karana* have been modified to become Parahyangan, Palemahan, and Pawongan. *Tri Hita Karana* means three sources of happiness or well-being. It is a balance and harmonious relationship between humans and God (*spiritual aspect/parahyangan*), among humans (*society aspect/pawongan*), and between humans and the environment (*environmental aspect/palemahan*) ([10]; [16]; [26]).

In this case, in explaining the process of developing the Sangeh Tourism Village, there are some indicators, such as First (*spiritual aspect/parahyangan*) The spiritual environment is an aspect that refers to human relations with the spiritual environment which shows humans as homo religious or as a creation that believes in the existence of God [26]. The tourism industry is expected to create a religious atmosphere as much as possible both inside and outside the environment [9]. Second, (*community aspect /pawongan*) Social environment is a human relationship that cannot live alone because humans' nature is to live and interact with each other. In this case what to do is always maintaining harmonious relations with various activities ([9]; [26]). Third (*environmental aspect/palemahan*) in general, Palemahan is an aspect of *Tri Hita Karana* which is everything related to the physical aspects of the environment ([9]; [26]).

Based on the concept of *Tri Hita Karana*, the development of Sangeh Tourism Village should pay attention to environmental sustainability to develop sustainably. Sustainable tourism is growing very rapidly, including an increase in the flow of accommodation capacity, local population, and environment, where tourism development and new investments in the tourism sector should not have a negative impact and can blend with the environment. Those can happen if we maximize the impact positively and minimize negative impacts [5].

Law Number 10 of 2009 regulate sustainable aspect concerning Tourism. However, the law states that tourism development must be carried out based on sustainable principles. Tourism development aims to preserve nature, the environment, and resources through the implementation of tourism development plans. Those are concerned with the diversity, uniqueness of culture and nature, as well as human needs for tourism.

Sustainable tourism focuses on the existence of sustainable elements in the development of the tourism industry. The aim is to reduce the negative impact as a result of the rapid development of the tourism industry. Sustainable tourism also focuses on developing the tourism industry, namely sustainable tourism villages by involving local people for their welfare. Sustainable in this case does not only consider environmental problems or issues but also economic, social, cultural, quality, health, safety, and aesthetic issues.

In this case, developing a sustainable Sangeh Tourism Village needed a parameter to see how the involvement of various actors cooperates in optimizing the development of a tourism village. So, it can give tourism products value with the unique characteristics of a tourism village product to differentiate it from other tourism. The characteristics of tourism products relating to the potential of tourism villages, such as traditional ceremonial activities to maintain and preserve local culture; management of local handicraft businesses with characteristics of regional culture; tourist destinations; management of culinary businesses as regional characteristics; management of lodging businesses and also business management in for grocery shops.

4.4 Conclusion

Based on the results study, it can be concluded that the dynamics of collaboration as an effort to develop a sustainable tourism village in the perspective of Tri Hita Karana in Sangeh Tourism Village, Badung Regency has fulfilled the collaboration component of the Ansell & Gash concept. The collaboration process begins with the starting conditions, namely setting the basic level of trust, conflict, and social models. It becomes a resource or obligation during collaboration. Second is facilitative leadership by providing mediation processes and facilities for collaborative processes. Third is institutional design, which establishes the basic rules of ongoing collaboration. The last is the process of collaboration. Sustainable tourism also focuses on developing the tourism industry, namely sustainable tourism villages by involving local people for their welfare. Sustainability in this case does not only consider environmental problems or issues but also economic, social, cultural, quality, health, safety, and aesthetic issues which are interrelated with the social conditions of the community, namely culture and customs in Tri Hita Karana's philosophy as a universal embodiment.

4.5 Policy Recommendations

Based on the research findings, there are recommendations as a reference for implementing tourism policies in the future.

- 1) The government is one of the facilitative actors in carrying out changes. Currently, to develop sustainably and to support various tourism activities is necessary to cooperate with all stakeholders. It is necessary to review new patterns of tourism development and follow developments and market targets. This strategy will simplify the government and tourism managers in developing the tourism sector.
- 2) The local government of Bali cannot be separated from customary authority. That is why the government should work hand in hand with traditional villages. Making changes should start from the smallest community, consolidate, and unite perceptions, then move on a macro basis, so it will be easier to do. In dealing with various phenomena of changes in tourism development, the government must be able to build togetherness and participation with all stakeholders, so accuracy and control decisions can be implemented effectively to develop sustainable tourism in the regions.

REFERENCES

- [1]. Agranoff, Robert & Michael McGuire. (2003). Collaborative Public Management: New Strategies for Local Governments. Washington DC: Georgetown University Press.
- [2]. Ansell, Chris, & Gash, A. (2007). Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice, *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 18(4), 543-571. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032>
- [3]. Ansell, C. & Gash, A. (2007). Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory Advance*. <https://doi:10.1093/jopart/mum032.Source:OAI,hlm.1-29>
- [4]. Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice. *Journal of public administration research and theory*, 18(4), 543-571
- [5]. Arida, I Nyoman Sukma. (2017). Pariwisata Berkelanjutan. Bali: Sustain Press.
- [6]. Chaffin, B. C., Gosnell, H., & Cosens, B. A. (2014). A decade of adaptive governance scholarship: synthesis and future directions. *Ecology and society*, 19(3). <http://dx.doi.org/10.5751/ES-06824-190356>
- [7]. Cleaver, F., & Whaley, L. (2018). Understanding process, power, and meaning in adaptive governance. *Ecology and Society*, 23(2). <https://doi.org/10.5751/ES-10212-230249>
- [8.] Cosens, B. A., Craig, R. K., Hirsch, S. L., Arnold, C. A. T., Benson, M. H., DeCaro, D. A., ... & Schlager, E. (2017). The role of law in adaptive governance. *Ecology and society: a journal of integrative science for resilience and sustainability*, 22(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.5751/ES-08731-220130>
- [9]. Dalem, A.A. G. R. (2007). Filosofi Tri Hita Karana dan Implementasinya Dalam Industri Pariwisata. Dalam: Kearifan Lokal Dalam Pengelolaan Lingkungan Hidup. Editor: Dalem, A. A. G. R et al., Denpasar: UPT Penerbit Universitas Udayana bekerjasama Pusat Pelatihan Lingkungan Hidup UNUD.
- [10]. Dalem, A. A. G. R. (2011). "Achievements and Challenges of Implementation of "Tri Hita Karana" for Creating Sustainable Tourism in Bali-Indonesia: A Case Study in Hotel Sectors". *Journal of Ritsumeikan Social Sciences and Humanities (Japan)*, 3.
- [11]. Emerson, K., Nabatchi, T., & Balogh, S. (2012). An integrative framework for collaborative governance. *Journal of public administration research and theory*, 22(1), 1-29. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mur011>
- [12]. Innes, J. E., & Booher, D. E. (2022). Consensus Building and Complex Adaptive Systems: A Framework for Evaluating Collaborative Planning. *Journal of the American Planning Association*. 65(4). 412–423. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01944369908976071>

- [13]. Istayu, P.U., Khrisno Hadi, Y. S. H. (2019). In The Development Of Sumenep Keraton Tourism In The Perspective Collaborative Governance. *Logos Journal*. 2(1). 24.
- [14]. Keyim, P. (2018). Tourism Collaborative Governance and Rural Community Development in Finland: The Case of Vuonislahti. *Journal of Travel Research*, 57(4), 483–494 <https://doi.org/10.1177/0047287517701858>
- [15]. Leman, L. A. (2018). Kolaborasi antar Stakeholders dalam Pengembangan Pariwisata Religi Sunan Giri di Kabupaten Gresik. *Kebijakan Dan Manajemen Publik*, 6(2), 1–11.
- [16]. Marjaya, I Made. (2010). “Tri Hita Karana A Conception in Conducting Balinese Arts” (Paper).
- [17.] Mattessich, P. W., & Monsey, B. R. (1992). *Collaboration, What Makes It Work: A Review of Research Literature on Factors Influencing Successful Collaboration*. Amherst H. Wilder Foundation.
- [18]. Miles, Matthew B.A., Huberman, M., and Saldana, J. (2014), *Qualitative Data Analysis. A Methods Sourcebook*. Edition 3. Los Angeles: Sage Publication.
- [19]. Molen, F. V. D. (2018). How Knowledge Enables Governance: The Coproduction Of Environmental Governance Capacity. *Environmental Science & Policy*. 87. 18-25. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsci.2018.05.016>
- [20]. Moleong, L. J. (2017). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- [21]. Mutiarawati, T., & Sudarmo. (2017). Collaborative Governance dalam Penanganan Rob di Kelurahan Bandengan Kota Pekalongan. *Jurnal Wacana Publik*, 1(2), 48–62.
- [22]. O'Flynn, J. L. dan Wanna, John. (2008). *Collaborative Governance: A New Era of Public Policy in Australia?. Australia and New Zealand School of Government*.
- [23]. Peraturan Menteri (Permen) Pariwisata Republik Indonesia Nomor 14 Tahun 2016 Tentang Pedoman Destinasi Pariwisata Berkelanjutan
- [24]. Rijke, J., Brown, R., Zevenbergen, C., Ashley, R., Farrelly, M., Morison, P., & van Herk, S. (2012). Fit-for-purpose governance: a framework to make adaptive governance operational. *Environmental science & policy*, 22, 73-84. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envsci.2012.06.010>
- [25]. Sharma-Wallace, L., Velarde, S. J., & Wreford, A. (2018). Adaptive governance good practice: Show me the evidence. *Journal of Environmental Management*, 222, 174-184. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2018.05.067>
- [26]. Suteja, Mertha. (2012). *Tri Hita Karana and World Peace, Bali Hinduism Philosophy of Life*. Surabaya: Paramita.
- [27]. Urbanus, I Nyoman dan Febianti, (2017). “Analisis dampak perkembangan pariwisata terhadap perilaku konsumtif masyarakat wilayah bali selatan”. Dalam *Jurnal kepariwisataan dan Hospitalitas*. Vol. 1 Nomor 2 Nopember 2017
- [28]. Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 10 Tahun 2009 tentang Kepariwisataaan.
- [29]. Wiyani, F., Wijaya, M. E., & Nawir, A. A. (2019). *Analysis Study of Open Data Implementation to Improve Public Policy Making Process in Jakarta Provincial Government Based on Dynamic Governance*.
- [30]. Wyborn, C. (2015). Co-productive governance: a relational framework for adaptive governance. *Global Environmental Change*, 30, 56-67. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gloenvcha.2014.10.009>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i5.2467>

This is an open access article licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>), which permits unrestricted, non-commercial use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the work is properly cited.