Inclusive Education in Higher Education Students: A Systematic Review in Scopus and Web of Science Between 2019 And 2023

Lissette Margarita Salas-Torres¹, Luis Alexander Pulido Joo^{2*}, Liliana Morales Yanayaco³, Miguel Ángel Canchari-Preciado⁴, Luis Fernando Espejo Chacón⁵, Jackeline Margot Saldaña-Millan⁶, Carol Giovanna Torres-Solano⁷

^{1,2,4,5}University César Vallejo, Lima, Peru; E-mail: <u>lpulidoj@ucvvirtual.edu.pe</u>

³University San Ignacio de Loyola, Lima, Peru

^{6,7}Technological University of Peru, Lima, Peru

Abstracts: This study performs a systematic review of the literature on inclusive education in higher education students. The research followed the guidelines of the PRISMA methodology for the identification of records in the Scopus and Web of Science (WoS) databases during the period 2019 to 2023. During the information search process, a total of 199 records were found. From both databases, which after going through rigorous inclusion and exclusion criteria, 17 investigations were finally obtained that were included for the review. The included studies sought to answer the research question: What factors are important to promote inclusive education as a pedagogical model in higher education students? According to the information found in the systematization of the articles, 2 tables of contents were generated that show the authors, countries/regions according to the corresponding author, the keywords of the studies, the dimensions, instruments, study approaches, strategies of execution and conclusions of the studies in order to contrast data to find strengths or weaknesses in the studies that support answering the research question. The results showed that Spain is the leading country in publication with corresponding authors, with 82.4% of all studies. Likewise, 47.01% of the studies presented a quantitative approach. On the other hand, educational strategies stand out such as: the use of digital resources (videoconference), the use of ApS (Service-Learning), civic moral disconnection and didactic strategies (physical activities), since they aim to develop dynamics of academic development, cognitive, social and professional with the aim of promoting inclusive education in higher education students. Another factor to consider is the positive attitude of teachers towards disability and cultural diversity, so that they promote inclusion in their practices. In this way, it is concluded that, to promote inclusive education in higher education students, the following should be considered: teacher support, the use of innovative educational strategies and the open participation of all students in inclusive activities to promote a diverse education atmosphere in order to support students with physical, mental, sensory disabilities or cultural differences to obtain professional training.

Keywords: Inclusive Education, Students, Higher Education, Educational Strategies, Systematic Review.

1. INTRODUCTION

Attention to the phenomenon of diversity in its multiple cultural, social, economic and geographic manifestations represents a great challenge at the global level, especially in a context in which international agreements have recognized the importance of cultural integration and the valuation of different human groups, without distinction, which must be included in international and national socio-demographic and educational policies [1]. Thus, in view of this new reality, democratic educational policies aimed at integration, inclusion and social equity have been generated at different educational levels, a situation that is perceived by society as a more open and tolerant form of coexistence in the face of the diversity of the human groups that make it up [2].

In higher education, the concept of inclusive education is conceived as a new way of understanding, comprehending and applying teaching and learning strategies aimed at valuing the cognitive, strategic and attitudinal capacities of students within a framework of social diversity, due to cultural, ethnic, religious, gender and economic aspects, even so, all students have the same possibilities to develop professional competencies [3]. Therefore, the generation of inclusive educational policies based on principles of equity and educational quality must constitute a social commitment that strengthens the university-society link [4].

However, although its specific actions have been included in the curricular policies of universities, its implementation in university classrooms represents a great challenge that implies assuming new roles in teaching, such as fostering collaborative, open, tolerant and respectful learning in the face of diversity and social inclusion [5].

Thus, advances in inclusive education policies, as well as social and labor policies, have been progressively showing progress and recognition in different countries around the world in relation to the rights of people with disabilities, the rights of the LGBT community, the rights of immigrants, aboriginal groups and vulnerable groups, which at different educational levels has given rise to what is now known as inclusive classrooms [6].

In this scenario, although it is true that higher education policies were previously conceived as exclusive, that is, they did not contemplate measures of inclusiveness and integration for students belonging to different groups or cultures, with the passing of time and even more so in the 21st century, the issue of inclusiveness has been gaining ground and being included in international, national and even local educational policies, both in initial, primary and secondary education, as well as in higher education [7], [8].

In Peru, social inclusion is also included in social and educational policies, since education is a right; and in the case of higher education, which the state seeks to vindicate, it is based on specific actions for better attention to students with economic problems, problems of access and attention to disabled students, respect and tolerance for gender orientation among students and university teachers [9], [10]. However, concrete progress in terms of inclusiveness is more tangible in private universities than in public universities, where serious deficiencies are still evident, especially in services for disabled students or awareness, appreciation and respect for immigrant students and/or those belonging to the LGTB community [11], [12].

The study of scientific production in relation to inclusive education in higher education is relevant because it allows analyzing and reflecting on different pedagogical experiences of inclusive university classrooms, advances and perspectives of research on inclusiveness in university education, as well as university policies of integration and social and educational inclusion in vocational training. In relation to the importance of inclusive education in the current context of social diversity, the aim is to systematize the literature in order to answer the research question: What factors are important to promote inclusive education as a pedagogical model in higher education students?

The existing literature in the Scopus and Web of Science (WoS) databases will be analyzed and systematized with the aim of answering the research question on inclusive education in higher education students in the period 2019-2023. For this reason, it is intended to identify the literature in Scopus and WoS between 2019-2023; to collect information on the research topic on the place/country of publication according to the corresponding author; also, to identify and order in a structured way the keywords, dimensions, instruments used in the research, approaches of the studies, application strategies and the concluded results.

2. METHODOLOGY

The study develops a systematic literature review (SLR), which is a critical, structured and replicable summary of the results of scientific studies that are available in different databases and that deal with the same topic. The review is useful as it provides a better scope and organized understanding to answer the research question [13], [14].

To carry out the research, we chose to use the "Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA)", which is a guide that follows a series of sequential steps that seek to unequivocally include studies for the systematization of scientific studies and for meta-analysis [15]. During the last few years, PRISMA has demonstrated great results by means of systematic studies, for this reason, a series of new concepts have been added to improve the elaboration of quality studies [16], [17].



Figure 1. PRISMA 2020 flow diagram for new systematic reviews which included searches of databases and registers only.

The Boolean descriptor AND was used to perform the search strings, which serves to collect the information. In the first search performed in both databases, strings were exchanged because both are in different languages, resulting in 199 as the total amount of search, these went through inclusion and exclusion filters, which finally resulted in 17 studies, for a better organization of the information, the PRISMA 2020 flowchart was used, as shown in Figure 1.

In order to answer the research question, we began with the phase of identifying the records in the databases consulted: Scopus and Web of Science (WoS), these databases were selected for convenience due to their impact and international prestige in multidisciplinary topics. For the search through the combination of keywords, two simple search strings were used in Spanish and their literal translation in English to expand the range of records. Table 1 shows the keywords and strings used, while Table 2 shows the identification of records in detail.

Table 1. Keywords, se	earch string
-----------------------	--------------

Key words	Search string
Inclusive education	"Inclusive education" AND "university students".
University student	"Inclusive education" AND "university students"

Database	Search equation	Total	(2019 - 2023)	Open Access, articles, language	Analysis and filtering of duplicate items
Scopus	"Educación inclusiva" AND "estudiantes universitarios"	0	0	0	0
	"Inclusive education" AND "university students"	112	72	15	14
Web of Science	"Educación inclusiva" AND "estudiantes universitarios"	0	0	0	1
Guence	"Inclusive education" AND "university students"	87	65	8	3
	Total	199	137	23	17

Table 2. Detail of scientific studies

The inclusion and exclusion criteria used for the identification of studies on inclusive education in higher education students during the period 2019-2023 are: (a) the studies must be related to inclusive education; (b) articles must be available in full PDF; (c) the archives must be from the period 2019 to 2023; (d) the selected publications must be in Spanish; (e) the studies must be related to higher education students; (f) the studies must be articles, excluding conference papers, reviews, books and theses.

It should be noted that based on the systematization of the research, two tables of contents were generated on the subject of the study. These tables highlight the author and year; title of the study; country of publication; key words of the different studies; dimensions; instruments used; approaches of each research; application strategies and finally the conclusions.

3. RESULTS

The results phase consists of 2 matrices generated from the 17 studies included in the review in order to answer the research question. The tables present the evidence collected and organized for each study. Regarding the scientific production of the countries according to corresponding authors, 82.4% (n=14) belong to Spain, which suggests a developed interest in inclusive education in higher education students. Also, it was identified that 11.8% (n=2) are studies belonging to Chile, and Colombia is the country with the lowest number of studies, being represented by 5.9% (n=1) of the total. In addition, of the 17 studies consulted, 47.01% are quantitative in approach.

3.1. Data Overview

	dimensions							
N°	Author/ year	Title	Country	Key words	Dimensions			
1	(Barreiro, 2022) [18]	Innovative actions and practices as tools for the promotion of inclusive education.	Spain	Innovation, learning, play, education, university, vulnerability.	Innovative dynamics, decision making, autonomy, motivation, involvement, academic performance, integral personality formation.			
2	(Sandoval et al., 2019) [7]	Inclusive or exclusive classrooms: barriers to learning and participation in university contexts.i	Spain	Inclusive education, universal design, university, barriers to learning and	Spaces and resources, contents and methodology, student participation.			

.showing: author/year, country of author of correspondence, keywords and

				participation.	
3	(Sánchez et al., 2023) [19]	Trans students. An opportunity for the development of feminist pedagogies in schools.	Spain	Trans students, attention to diversity, gender diversity, inclusive education, facilitating factors, feminist pedagogies.	Dropout rates, educational factors, school spaces, respectful environments.
4	(De Barros et al., 2021) [20]	Analysis through structural modeling of the relationship between teaching practices, multiculturalism and educational inclusion.	Spain	Teaching practices, multiculturalism, inclusive education, methodology.	Pluriculturality, teaching practices, educational inclusion.
5	(Mella et al., 2021) [21]	Service-learning and social civic development in university degrees in the field of education: preparing students for the practice of inclusive education	Spain	Service-learning, civic competencies, higher education, university students, inclusive education, education professionals.	Leadership, prosocial behavior, intercultural competence, teamwork.
6	(Cabrera et al., 2022) [22]	Civic moral disengagement, empathy and attitudes of prospective teachers towards cultural diversity.	Spain	Empathy, civic moral disconnect, attitude, cultural diversity, teacher training.	Beliefs, emotions, behaviors, intentions, empathy, cultural diversity.
7	(Rebollo y Losada, 2022) [23]	The Early Childhood Education teacher facing inclusive education: competencies and needs.	Spain	Preschool teacher education, university student, teacher competencies, attention to diversity.	Diagnosis of specific educational support needs resources and strategies to address diversity, evolutionary and learning characteristics of students, communication and coordination between educational agents.
8	(Falla et al., 2022) [24]	Engagement in teacher training as a promoter of inclusive attitudes.	Spain	Inclusive education, academic engagement, attitudes, teacher training, higher education.	Diversity concept, support methodology, community involvement, vigor, dedication, absorption.
9	(Hernández y De Barros, 2021) [25]	Inclusion, attention to diversity and neuroeducation in Physical Education.	Spain	Inclusive education, diversity, neuroscience, neuroeducation, physical education.	Educational inclusion, measures of attention to diversity, neuroeducation.
10	(Cotán., 2019) [26]	Educational inclusion, measures of attention to diversity, neuroeducation.	Spain	Students with disabilities, higher education institutions, lifeline, inclusive education, biographical-narrative method.	Facilitators, hinderers, students with disabilities, university trajectory, narrative analysis.
11	(Tejeda, 2022) [27]	The Experience of University Students with Disabilities in an Indigenous Context in relation to Evaluation	Chile	Educational assessment, social justice, disability, university, inclusive education.	Cognitive, spiritual, university evaluative experience, learning environment, interaction with teachers, fairness and inclusion, student proactivity.
12	(Martínez et al., 2023) [28]	Perception of self- sufficiency towards inclusion in future Physical Education teachers: a study in a Chilean context.	Chile	Inclusion, disability, adaptation, self- efficacy, physical education.	Intellectual, motor, auditory, visual.
13	(Maravé et al., 2022) [29]	Promotion of educational inclusion in teacher training through the application of University Service-Learning in the field of functional diversity.	Spain	Service-Learning, teacher training, motor skills, functional diversity, educational inclusion.	Technical, cultural, political, post- structural.

15	(Arias et al., 2020) [31]	Students with special educational needs in the classroom, what can future teachers expect?	Spain	Special educational needs, educational inclusion, future teachers.	Educational integration, teachers' discomfort with having students with disabilities, teachers' perception of unfavorable attitudes towards students with disabilities on the part of their colleagues, teachers' perception of their lack of preparation to serve students with disabilities.
16	(Dominguez et al., 2020) [32]	Assessment of support needs in university students with functional diversity of physical origin: A case study.	Colombia	Functional diversity, physical disability, support needs, inclusive education, inclusion, public policy.	The culture, policies and practices of inclusive education.
17	(Gómez et al., 2021) [33]	Videoconferencing: An educational resource to promote intercultural communication among students.	Spain	Virtual learning, communication, higher education, cultural exchange, videoconferencing.	Virtual exchange, virtual intercultural communications, social presence, cognitive presence, teaching presence.

Table 4. Scientific evidence on inclusive education in higher education students, identifying instrument, approach,

strategies, and conclusions

N°	Instrument	Focus	Strategies	Conclusions
1	Surveys	Mixed (Quantitative - Qualitative)	An evaluation was carried out so that students could analyze the characteristics of the project, the established objectives, the proposed methodology, the relation of the practical activities with their future insertion in the labor market and their participation in such activities. The students' satisfaction with the project was also evaluated, taking into account the number of satisfied students.	It has been observed that this type of interventions has a significant impact on students' motivation, while fostering the acquisition of innovative knowledge and promoting new ways of acting and approaches to work. In addition, innovative and effective solutions have been developed to intervene with students who have specific educational support needs. The main objective has been to promote and increase motivation for learning the contents of the subject Psychological Bases of Attention to Diversity.
2	Ad Hoc Questionnaire	Quantitative	A questionnaire was used to obtain the opinion of university students on the accessibility of the spaces and materials used in the contents and methodologies, as well as on the opportunities for participation in their own learning process. The questionnaire consisted of 25 items with responses on a Likert scale, ranging from 0 (Never) to 5 (Always). In addition, two open-ended questions were included in which participants had the opportunity to express their opinion on the suitability and equipment of university facilities and the teaching response to student diversity.	These results indicate that students perceive obstacles both in the classroom spaces and resources as well as in the teaching methodology and student participation. There is a lack of adaptation of content to the students' learning pace, little presentation of key concepts by professors, few pauses during explanations, little information on support resources in the teaching guides and rare occasions in which professors use students' life experiences as didactic resources.
3	Biographical interviews	Qualitative	In-depth biographical interviews were conducted with trans students who were studying at university. These interviews aimed to reconstruct their experiences during their high school years. On the other hand, the interviews provided examples of successful academic experiences, which made it possible to contrast them with the reality of	The results highlight the positive influence of certain teachers who acted as role models and provided support, as well as the importance of perceiving school environments as safe. The responsibility of educational institutions to create spaces respectful of diversities, especially for trans students, is highlighted. These findings underscore the need to provide teacher training from a transfeminist perspective

4 Liker Scale Duantitative A quasi-experimental design ways of thinking through a carefully planed conversation designed to elict specific information in an atmosphere of trust and opponess. Content validation was satisfactory and an opponess. 4 Liker Scale Quantitative The target population is university and thinking through a carefully planed to population is university and the planed to obtain ample of teachers. A Liker scale with 3t ample of teachers. A Liker scale with 3t and the planed to obtain ample of teachers. A Liker scale with 3t and the planed to obtain ample of teachers. A Liker scale with 3t and the scale scale scale scale scale scale scale obustion at the planed to obtain ample of teachers. A Liker scale with 3t and the scale scale scale scale scale scale obustion and the scale scale scale scale scale scale scale induces scale scale scale scale scale scale scale scale scale induces scale sc					
4 Lkert Scale Quantitative The target population is university students, and it is planned to obtain a single of teachers. A Likert scale with the construct. The nexults provided translable conclusions. In the pluriculturality dimensions. In the pluriculturality dimensions. In the pluriculturality dimensions. The observement inclusion. exploratory factor analysis was carried out to variable conclusions. In the pluriculturality dimensions. In the pluriculturality dimensions. The pluricultural and inclusion. exploratory factor analysis was carried out to variable conclusions. In the pluriculturality dimensions. In the pluriculturality distances and solucationnaire Obsets innaire on Civic Social I Competences and Sali-Efficacy of University Students in CuccoCSA Quantitative (Quantitative) A quasi-experimental design was independent variable was participation in socie-atearning projects outperform their postest questionnaires were applied to two independent variable was participation in socie-atearning projects. Pretest Students in Diversity Students in CuccoCSA Quantitative (Quantitative) The isotre previous of students involved in service- learning and the control group (explore the relevance of service- tearning and the control group (explore the relevance) of service- to active associal behavior, intercultural completence and professional identity. The effect composed of students involved in service- learning appresent intervice the control group (explore the study revealed that there is a significant inversity is straing the survey, consent was obtained professional identity. 6 Cuestionario de Empada (Eff5) Adationary preticas of the group of students appendix (Moral I Disergagement (MODs) Mixed (Quantitative) Qualitative) The equeston				interviews is to obtain information about students' perceptions, feelings and ways of thinking through a carefully planned conversation designed to elicit specific information in an atmosphere of trust and	demonstrating a willingness to address diverse gender and sexual identities.
7 Question of Post-test Questionnaire Post-test Questionnaire Question de participation Question of Professional Profiles of the Qualitative) The questionnaire specifically designed to identify the degree of mastery and relevance of these conducted onlin using Google Forms, and all question Relevance of these conducted onlin using Google Forms, and all question researchers o increase student participation and was based on the complex relationship between researchers o increase student participation and was based on the searcher o increase student participation and was based on the researchers o increase student the level of mastery and relevance of these completen	4	Likert Scale	Quantitative	students, and it is planned to obtain a sample of teachers. A Likert scale with 31 items was used, specifically developed through an operationalization table. This scale covers three dimensions: multiculturalism, teaching practices and	exploratory factor analysis was carried out to validate the construct. The results provided remarkable conclusions. In the pluriculturality dimension, the concept of interculturality and its relationship with inclusion were identified as relevant elements. Through structural equation modeling, conclusions were obtained, such as the importance of teaching practices being pluricultural and inclusive, since both aspects
Cuestionano de Actitudes hacia la Diversidad Cultural (ADC)Spanish universities were contacted to collect data. They were provided with prelemation about the study and approval was obtained from each faculty member responsible. Before qualitative)The results of the study revealed that there is a significant inverse relationship between is a significant inverse relationship between tacity member responsible. Before role in this relationship. These findings are in line with relationship. These findings are in line with relationship between empathy and mechanisms of civic moral disengagement.6Asseing Civic Moral Disengagement (CMDs)MixedAsseing Civic MoralNewer set as mandatory, except those related to sociodemographic data, in order to avoid loss of information.The guestionnaire specifically designed to identify the degree of mastery and relevance of the see competencies in attention to diversity was developed. The application of the questionnaire were application and was based on the researchers to increase student participation and was based on the researchers to increase student participation and was based on the researchers to increase student participation and was based on the researchers in attention to diversity in the training program, and they were also asked to provide an opp response where they could express how they believe the competencies in attention to the see dispersional. These findings reparation and greement or disagreement with respect of the see dasked to provide an opp response where they could express how they believe the competency profile of the Degree in Early Childhood Education the see dasked to provide an opp response where they could express how they believe the competency profile of the Degree in Early	5	Questionnaire Post-test Questionnaire on Civic-Social Competences and Self-Efficacy of University Students	Quantitative	implemented in the study, where the independent variable was participation in service-learning projects. Pretest and posttest questionnaires were applied to two groups: the experimental group (EG), composed of students involved in service- learning, and the control group (CG), composed of those who did not participate. The dimensions of leadership, prosocial behavior, intercultural competence and	in service-learning projects outperform their peers in the dimensions of intercultural competence, prosocial behavior, and teamwork. These results support the relevance of service- learning as a tool that combines cognitive development with a civic and social dimension of learning, highlighting the importance of these competencies for education students, where knowledge, skills and attitudes with a social and civic orientation are distinctive elements of their
 7 Question of Professional Profises of the Degree in Early Childhood Education 7 Mixed 9 Professional Profiles of the Degree in Early Childhood Education 9 Mixed 9 Mixed	6	de Actitudes hacia la Diversidad Cultural (ADC) Escala Básica de Empatía (BES) Asseing Civic Moral Disengagement	(Quantitative -	Spanish universities were contacted to collect data. They were provided with preliminary information about the study and approval was obtained from each faculty member responsible. Before starting the survey, consent was obtained from the participating university students. The questionnaires were conducted online using Google Forms, and all questions were set as mandatory, except those related to sociodemographic data, in order	is a significant inverse relationship between positive attitudes toward cultural diversity and certain expressions of civic moral disengagement. In addition, cognitive and affective empathy were found to play an indirect role in this relationship. These findings are in line with findings from social, behavioral, and developmental neuroscience, highlighting the complex relationship between empathy and
8 Teacher Quantitative The aim of this study is to determine The results of the study indicate that women	7	Professional Profiles of the Degree in Early Childhood	(Quantitative -	to identify the degree of mastery and relevance of these competencies in attention to diversity was developed. The application of the questionnaire was carried out in the presence of the researchers to increase student participation and was based on the competencies described in the Report of the Degree in Early Childhood Education. The students responded by indicating their agreement or disagreement with respect to the level of mastery and relevance of these competencies in attention to diversity in the training program, and they were also asked to provide an open response where they could express how they believe the competency profile of the Degree in Early Childhood Education could be improved in relation to these	training (IPT) in attention to diversity was observed, but the level of mastery was found to be lower than the relevance attributed in all the dimensions studied. Continuing education needs were identified, especially in areas such as diagnostic knowledge and cooperation among professionals. These findings highlight the need for improvements in initial teacher training, incorporating more practical content and encouraging greater commitment of students and practicing teachers to continuing
	8	Teacher	Quantitative	The aim of this study is to determine	The results of the study indicate that women

	Evaluation Questionnaire for Inclusive Education (CEFI- R) Attitude Survey Inclusive Education Questionnaire (Attitude Survey Inclusive Education		whether the academic engagement of university students has an influence on their appraisal of inclusion training, and whether a more positive appraisal is related to favorable attitudes towards the inclusion of students with special educational needs (SEN). A single questionnaire was used and distributed online via Google Forms. One of the researchers presented the link to the students during the classes, both face-to- face and virtual, and explained to them	obtain higher scores in academic engagement, valuing training in inclusion and positive attitudes towards the inclusion of students with special educational needs (SEN). A direct and positive relationship was found between academic engagement and more favorable attitudes towards inclusion, and it was determined that valuing training acted as a mediator with an effect greater than 50% in the relationship between academic engagement and attitudes towards inclusion.
	Questionnaire) Student Questionnaire Utrecht Work Engagement Scale (UWE-S)		that this was a voluntary scientific study that guaranteed the privacy and confidentiality of the information.	
9	Likert Scale	Quantitative	The main objective of this study is to examine the relationship between inclusion, attention to diversity and neuroeducation in the field of Physical Education. To carry out this research, a Likert scale composed of 30 items, with an odd number of options, five response levels and a score range from 1 to 5, was used as the research instrument.	The most outstanding result of this research is the confirmation of the relationship between the three dimensions studied, although with different levels of intensity and nuances that will be discussed later. It allows us to analyze the relationship between educational inclusion, measures of attention to diversity and neuroeducation. The confirmatory factor analyses (CFA) have allowed us to conclude that there is a relationship, being stronger between inclusion and attention to diversity, and between the latter and neuroeducation, while the relationship between inclusion and neuroeducation is less pronounced.
10	Biographical interviews Focused interviews Semi- structured interviews Self-reports Life Line	Qualitative	En este trabajo, se presentarán los datos recopilados a través de la técnica de la línea de vida, que se considera una herramienta integral para revisar los momentos más importantes en la experiencia de los participantes. En esta sección, se presentarán las historias de vida de dos participantes, Andrés y Rafael, centrándose en sus trayectorias educativas en instituciones de Educación Superior utilizando la técnica de la línea de vida. A lo largo de esta sección, se analizarán y trabajarán las narraciones personales de ambos participantes, explorando sus vivencias y experiencias en dichas instituciones y examinando los procesos que consideran obstaculizadores o facilitadores.	In this context, research participants highlighted the importance of teachers in ensuring inclusive educational practices. The work emphasizes the urgent need for teachers to adopt a positive attitude towards disability, promoting inclusive practices and considering diverse methodologies beyond traditional lectures. However, it was observed that on some occasions some teachers are reluctant to make curricular adaptations, as they believe that this could lower the level of teaching or unfairly favor students with disabilities compared to their non-disabled peers.
11	Biographical narrative Semi- structured interview	Qualitative	In the first stage of the research, biographical narrative was used to explore the students' evaluative experience, from their school career to university. Critical and relevant incidents related to evaluation were examined, leading to the identification of key dimensions to construct a semi-structured interview in the next phase of the research. The interview provided an opportunity to delve specifically into the university evaluative experience, including the learning environment, interaction with professors, and suggestions for improving the process.	The results highlight the importance of adopting pedagogical approaches based on social justice in assessments used with students with disabilities. This will help to promote more equitable and inclusive educational processes. In addition, the results point to the need to explore alternative approaches to assessment that are equitable, innovative and inclusive. Regarding the results related to the impact of educational assessment on students with disabilities in university settings, differences are observed in the evaluative process compared to their peers without disabilities.

15	Questionnaire	Quantitative	Infojobs and Jooble. In this research study, the concerns of prospective teachers regarding the inclusion of students with special educational needs in regular classrooms were examined. For this purpose, a questionnaire consisting of questions that were answered using a Likert scale was used. Likert scales are a tool that allows inferring attitudes, thoughts, beliefs and probable behaviors on a given topic through questions that are answered by indicating the degree of agreement on a sequential numerical scale.	The results obtained in this study showed that the scale used is reliable and valid, and it was investigated whether some personal characteristics of the university students influenced their perception. It was found that the presence of students with special educational needs in the classroom generates little concern in these university students, regardless of their gender, year of study and personal relationships they have had with people with functional diversity. Future faculty do not show particular concern about the inclusion of students with disabilities. In addition, the validation of the questionnaire used contributes to scientific progress in this field, by showing that the
14	Digital tools Questionnaire s	Quantitative	Since the program's inception, training has been provided to refugee women in a variety of digital skills. This includes the use of tablets, email, Google calendar, Zoom, Google Drive and the creation of questionnaires using Google Forms. In addition, they have been provided with training on technology tools to improve their chances of success in their job search. Some of these tools include LinkedIn, which allows them to search for jobs, network and highlight their skills and abilities, and Canva, a website that simplifies graphic design and makes it easier for them to create their resume. They have been trained on other job search platforms and applications, such as	Thanks to the research and collaboration of several entities, it has been found that refugees lack the training in digital skills necessary for their social and labor inclusion by the administrations. It has been observed that many organizations, due to lack of time and economic resources, carry out formalities instead of providing beneficiaries with the necessary digital skills. This study presents a Service Learning experience in which university students have contributed to the social inclusion of refugee women at the university and have received real training in formal education.
13	ApS Follow- up Notebook	Qualitative	The results support the existing research by showing a change in the students' personal and teaching identity, highlighting Service-Learning (SL) as an effective tool to promote learning, values and feelings necessary to move towards educational inclusion. Through the ApS implemented, university students have carried out sessions of motor games and body expression, which has allowed them to interact with children with functional diversity and their families. This study has been conducted using a qualitative approach and the main method of data collection has been through monitoring diaries completed by the participating students themselves.	The results support previous research by demonstrating that Service-Learning (SL) provokes a change in the personal and teaching identity of students. In addition, it is highlighted that ApS is an appropriate tool to promote learning, values and feelings that are fundamental to move towards educational inclusion. This approach has favored the development of values and feelings related to the understanding of the concept of educational inclusion in students.
12	Questionnaire	Quantitative	A questionnaire called "Perception of self-efficacy towards inclusion in future Physical Education teachers" was used to assess the perception of self-efficacy in relation to inclusion on the part of future Physical Education teachers. The questionnaire was administered during the face-to-face classes that the FIPEF (Initial Physical Education Teacher Training) students were taking in the final stage of their university training. It is important to note that the instrument used had been previously validated for Spanish-speaking contexts	The results indicate that the level of confidence of future teachers is moderate to high, and no significant differences were observed between the different dimensions of the questionnaire (intellectual, motor, auditory and visual). FIPEF students need confidence and specific preparation to be able to plan classes that include students with disabilities, with the purpose of providing education from an inclusive perspective.

				needs generates low concern.
16	In-depth interview Focus group Documentary analysis	Qualitative	In-depth interviews were conducted with three students with physical disabilities in order to obtain detailed information about their experiences. In addition, a focus group was used to collect the participants' perceptions, opinions and complaints. Two additional groups were formed: one composed of six student peers of the participants and another composed of seven teachers. This triangulation strategy made it possible to obtain different perspectives on the subject. A documentary analysis was also conducted to evaluate the educational care program and the national inclusion policy.	Participants expressed the existence of physical barriers, lack of social participation in various settings, and the need for psychological support. The importance of higher education institutions being inclusive in addressing these needs is recognized. Support needs related to infrastructure and inclusive education are highlighted as potentially influencing the emergence of psychological support needs in students with physical disabilities.
17	Videoconferen cing (Skype)	Qualitative	Videoconferencing via Skype was used as a tool for the production and collection of information, allowing virtual communication between people. Its main objective was to facilitate a collaborative work environment and open communication, fostering cultural exchange and learning through the sharing of knowledge and experiences.	It was evident that social presence has a strong impact on virtual communication among students, followed by cognitive presence and, to a lesser extent, teaching presence. Videoconferencing has become a means of dialogue, virtual learning, cultural exchange, and social and cognitive development for the students in the study. This demonstrates the usefulness of videoconferencing as a resource to promote communication between students from different cultures, foster dialogue, facilitate cultural exchange, and promote social and cognitive growth. The findings of this research have practical implications for the educational community at large.

CONCLUSION AND DISCUSSION

The objective of this study was to systematize the scientific data obtained from the literature consulted on educational education in higher education students, considering the strategies and results obtained. One of the key factors to promote inclusive education in higher education students is the integration of strategies, which are: ApS, civic moral disconnection, videoconferencing and didactic strategies (physical activity). Service-learning (ApS) is presented as an educational strategy that seeks not only cognitive and academic growth, but also social and professional development, improving the performance and performance of students with special educational needs (SEN) [21]. Likewise, use was made of civic moral disengagement strategies, which is based on the development of the improvement of individual convictions and behaviors through the incorporation of various moral ideals, generating social inclusion and cultural diversity [22].

In addition, the use of videoconferencing was evidenced, which has become a means of dialogue, virtual learning, cultural exchange and social and cognitive development [33]. It could be observed that the use of didactic strategies consisting of physical activities such as assertive techniques, encourage the interaction of students with disabilities with the rest of their peers [32]. These strategies are effective in achieving a transformation in the perceptions, attitudes and beliefs of students with disabilities and cultural diversity, generating a positive impact on their social relationships.

From the findings obtained, it is evident that students are aware of the existence of obstacles in the spaces, the resources available in the classrooms and the pedagogical approaches used. It is observed that there is a lack of adaptation of the contents to the learning pace of the students due to a poor presentation of key concepts by the teachers [7]. On the other hand, it is important to use pedagogical approaches based on social justice in the evaluations of excluded students, as this will contribute to foster more equitable and inclusive educational processes [27]. Furthermore, the urgent need for teachers to adopt a positive attitude towards disability and cultural diversity in order to promote inclusion in their practices is emphasized [26].

It is concluded that educational inclusion in university higher education students is an aspect that requires greater attention and development, especially considering the growing number of students with disabilities and cultural diversity who enter university institutions with the objective of obtaining professional training. A relationship was found between teacher training on inclusion issues and the teaching of an inclusive culture in higher education students, which translates into greater acceptance and openness towards cultural diversity. This implies the need to develop new forms of access to higher education, strengthen continuing education programs for professors, encourage student participation in inclusive situations, improve accessibility and disseminate basic information on inclusion and cultural diversity.

REFERENCES

- [1] Villalobos I. Inclusión educativa en contextos de educación superior. Una revisión narrativa. Revista Sul-Americana de Psicologia 2021;9:39–62. https://doi.org/10.29344/2318650X.1.2753.
- [2] Castillo P. Inclusión educativa en la formación docente en Chile: tensiones y perspectivas de cambio. Revista de Estudios y Experiencias En Educación 2021;20:359–75. https://doi.org/10.21703/rexe.20212043castillo19.
- [3] Diaz D, Pittz T. Educating beyond the classroom: alumni giving and the value of campus culture. Studies in Higher Education 2019;44:2208–22. https://doi.org/10.1080/03075079.2018.1482269.
- [4] Clavijo R, Bautista M. La educación inclusiva. Análisis y reflexiones en la educación superior ecuatoriana. Alteridad 2020;15:113–24. https://doi.org/10.17163/alt.v15n1.2020.09.
- [5] Garcés E, Alcívar O, Garcés E. La educación inclusiva en la universidad: reclamos y propuestas. Revista Universidad y Sociedad 2022;14:336–43.
- [6] Delgado K, Vivas D, Sánchez J, Carrión B. Inclusive education in higher education: Proposal for a model of care in Ecuador. Revista de Ciencias Sociales 2021;27:14–27.
- [7] Sandoval M, Simón C, Márquez C. ¿Aulas inclusivas o excluyentes?: barreras para el aprendizaje y la participación en contextos universitarios. Revista complutense de educación 2019;30:261–76.
- [8] Moriña A, Cotán A. Educación Inclusiva y Enseñanza Superior desde la mirada de estudiantes con diversidad funcional. Docencia univ 2017;11:20–37. https://doi.org/10.19083/ridu.11.528.
- [9] Perera V, Melero N, Moriña A. Prácticas docentes para una educación inclusiva en la universidad con estudiantes con discapacidad: Percepciones del profesorado. Revista mexicana de investigación educativa 2022;27:433–54.
- [10] Laderas E, Huauya P, Coaquira V. COVID-19, un desafío para la educación inclusiva en el Perú. Revista Educación 2020;18:45–74.
- [11] Ahmed F, Ahmed N, Pissarides C, Stiglitz J. Why inequality could spread COVID-19. The Lancet Public Health 2020;5:e240. https://doi.org/10.1016/S2468-2667(20)30085-2.
- [12] Velazque L, Valenzuela C, Murillo F. Pandemia COVID-19: repercusiones en la educación universitaria. Odontología Sanmarquina 2020;23:203–5. https://doi.org/10.15381/os.v23i2.17766.
- [13] Suyo-Vega J, da Costa A, Inês A. Revisión sistemática sobre aprendizaje autónomo universitario a través de la virtualidad. Cuadernos de desarrollo aplicados a las TIC 2021;10:17–47.
- [14] Linares E, Hernández V, Domínguez J, Fernández S, Hevia V, Mayor J, et al. Metodología de una revisión sistemática. Actas Urol Esp 2018;42:499–506. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.acuro.2018.01.010.
- [15] Shahbaz, M., Jam, F. A., Bibi, S., & Loganathan, N. (2016). Multivariate Granger causality between CO2 emissions, energy intensity and economic growth in Portugal: evidence from cointegration and causality analysis. Technological and Economic Development of Economy, 22(1), 47-74.
- [16] Urrútia G, Bonfill X. Declaración PRISMA: una propuesta para mejorar la publicación de revisiones sistemáticas y metaanálisis. Med Clin (Barc) 2010;135:507–11. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.medcli.2010.01.015.
- [17] Page M, McKenzie J, Bossuyt P, Boutron I, Hoffmann T, Mulrow C, et al. Declaración PRISMA 2020: una guía actualizada para la publicación de revisiones sistemáticas. Revista Española de Cardiología 2021;74:790–9. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.recesp.2021.06.016.
- [18] Hutton B, Catalá F, Moher D. La extensión de la declaración PRISMA para revisiones sistemáticas que incorporan metaanálisis en red: PRISMA-NMA. Med Clin (Barc) 2016;147:262–6. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.medcli.2016.02.025.
- [19] Barreiro A. Actuaciones y prácticas innovadoras como herramientas para el fomento de la educación inclusiva. En-claves del pensamiento 2022;16. https://doi.org/10.46530/ecdp.v0i31.503.
- [20] Sánchez M, García R, Penna M. Alumnado trans. Una oportunidad para el desarrollo de pedagogías feministas en la escuela. EDUCAR 2023;59:115–29. https://doi.org/10.5565/rev/educar.1569.
- [21] De Barros C, Hernández A, Ortiz M. Análisis a través de modelaje estructural de la relación entre prácticas docentes, pluriculturalidad e inclusión educativa. Revista Electrónica Interuniversitaria de Formación del Profesorado 2021;24:87–99. https://doi.org/10.6018/reifop.436051.
- [22] Mella-Núñez I, Quiroga-Carrillo A, Crespo J. Aprendizaje-servicio y desarrollo cívico-social en titulaciones universitarias del ámbito educativo: preparando al alumnado para la práctica de una educación inclusiva. EDUCAR 2021;57:363–77. https://doi.org/10.5565/rev/educar.1241.

- [23] Cabrera-Vázquez A, Romera E, Ortega-Ruiz R, Gil C, Falla D. Desconexión moral cívica, empatía y actitudes de futuros docentes hacia la diversidad cultural. Aula Abierta 2022;51:285–92. https://doi.org/10.17811/rifie.51.3.2022.285-292.
- [24] Rebollo-Quintela N, Losada-Puente L. El maestro en Educación Infantil ante la educación inclusiva: competencias y necesidades. publicaciones 2022;52:35–56. https://doi.org/10.30827/publicaciones.v52i2.22237.
- [25] Falla D, Alejandres C, Gil C. Engagement en la formación docente como impulsor de actitudes inclusivas. Educación XX1 2022;25:251–71. https://doi.org/10.5944/educxx1.30369.
- [26] Hernández A, De Barros C. Inclusión, atención a la diversidad y neuroeducación en Educación Física. Retos 2021;41:555-61. https://doi.org/10.47197/retos.v0i41.86070.
- [27] Reyes, E. R. de los . (2023). Inattentive Behavior of Children with ADHD under Inclusive Education Program: Basis for Intervention Program. International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology, 10(2), 66-69. https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i2.1154
- [28] Cotán A. Investigación narrativa para contar historias: líneas de vida de estudiantes universitarios con discapacidad. Revista de la educación superior 2019;48:23–47.
- [29] Tejeda P. La experiencia de estudiantes universitarios en situación de discapacidad en contexto indígena frente a la evaluación. Revista internacional de educación para la justicia social (RIEJS) 2022;11:83–100.
- [30] Martínez C, Deneb E, Pindal C, Gallardo F, Carter B, Peña S. Percepción de autosuficiencia hacia la inclusión en el futuro profesorado de Educación Física: un estudio en contexto chileno. Retos 2023;48:919–26. https://doi.org/10.47197/retos.v48.97413.
- [31] Maravé M, Salvador C, Gil J, Chiva O. Promoción de la inclusión educativa en la formación docente a través de la aplicación de Aprendizaje-Servicio Universitario en el ámbito de la diversidad funcional. Retos 2022;45:163–73. https://doi.org/10.47197/retos.v45i0.92688.
- [32] Bueno T, Francia R, García N. Propuesta metodológica para una educación inclusiva: Co-diseño de una formación en habilidades digitales con mujeres refugiadas. revHUMAN 2022;12:1–12. https://doi.org/10.37467/revhuman.v11.3904.
- [33] Arias S, Diez P, Cubero R. Percepciones de los futuros docentes en relación a la inclusión del estudiantado con necesidades educativas especiales en aulas ordinarias. ijeri 2020:180–96. https://doi.org/10.46661/ijeri.4390.
- [34] Domínguez K, Alvis Y, Sahagún M. Evaluación De Necesidades De Apoyo En Universitarios Con Diversidad Funcional De Origen Físico: Un Estudio De Caso. Revista Colombiana de Ciencias Sociales 2020;11:456–78.
- [35] Gómez L, Gutiérrez E, Moreno I. La videoconferencia: recurso educativo para promover la educación intercultural entre los estudiantes. Profesorado, Revista de Currículum y Formación del Profesorado 2021;25:213–36. https://doi.org/10.30827/profesorado.v25i2.8265.

DOI: https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i4.2108

This is an open access article licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/), which permits unrestricted, non-commercial use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the work is properly cited.