

A Comparative Study of Student Selection Systems in Korean and American Teacher Training Universities Focusing on Music Teachers

Professor Seungyoun Hong*

Department of Music Education Gwangju National University of Education South Korea; E-mail: syhong@gnue.ac.kr

Abstracts: This study aims to enhance the system for nurturing elementary school music teachers in South Korea through a comparative analysis with the United States, focusing on the student selection methods and curricular approaches in teacher training universities. By examining the differences between the two countries, particularly in relation to the admission process and the content of music education programs, this research seeks to identify potential areas for improvement in South Korea's teacher preparation system. The findings reveal significant differences between the two countries in their approach to selecting pre-music teachers. All 10 universities of education in Korea do not require applicants to demonstrate prior musical knowledge or proficiency in playing musical instruments for admission into the music education department. In contrast, the music education departments of the 10 universities in the United States mandate auditions, indicating a higher level of preparedness expected from applicants. It shows that minimum preparation to become a music teacher, handling musical instruments, basic musical knowledge has a great impact on teaching music and the teachers' own efficacy.

Keywords: Teacher Preparation, Music Education, Student Selection Systems, Comparative Analysis, Korean Universities, American Universities.

1. INTRODUCTION

The quality of education is intricately tied to the quality of teachers, as they play a crucial role in shaping students' learning experiences. When teachers lack a deep understanding of their subjects, their decision-making may be guided by intuition and hope, reflecting the limitations of their knowledge and beliefs (Reimer, 1989). Consequently, the role of teachers in education becomes of paramount importance. To improve the quality of education, OECD countries have invested in enhancing the competence of teachers, offering various incentives to maintain high standards. Moreover, teacher training colleges and institutions have made efforts to identify and select high-quality pre-service teachers. In this context, Korea has undergone numerous changes, such as reforming recruitment tests, aiming to secure teachers with professionalism and competency (K.I.C.E., 2015).

Beyond the focus on teacher quality, the Korean government has also been proactive in revising the curriculum for elementary, middle, and high schools, making necessary adjustments through the Ministry of Education and the Korean Institute of Curriculum and Evaluation. Recently, in 2022, the government has been actively working on revising the curriculum for various subjects, including music, in collaboration with relevant institutions. However, despite these efforts, there has been a gradual decline in both teachers' and students' interest in the music subject (Hong, 2021).

Studies conducted by Hong (2012) revealed a concerning lack of musical literacy among elementary school teachers in Gwangju and Chonnam province in Korea, a skill essential for conducting creative music classes. Additionally, another study by Hong (2014) found that teachers, regardless of their experience, encountered difficulties in comprehending and preparing lessons based on music textbooks.

The lack of interest in general music classes in Korean school settings is a complex issue that affects most elementary schools, and it persists even when ample musical instruments and high-tech materials are provided. While some studies have investigated this problem, a clear solution to address this phenomenon has not yet been proposed (Yoon, 2018a,b).

A comparative analysis of elementary school teacher training courses in Korea and the United States conducted by Lee (2020) highlighted significant differences between the two systems. Notably, while both countries conduct elementary school teacher training at general four-year colleges, the management of required subjects, credits, teacher qualification exams, and the inclusion of special education-related subjects vary substantially. Specifically, the United States places greater emphasis on special education-related subjects with a rate of 16%, whereas Korea's rate is merely 2%.

Unlike the United States, Korea does not have a separate position for elementary school music teachers, allowing individuals to gain admission to the college of education without prior knowledge of music or musical instruments. Additionally, Korean elementary school teachers, who are responsible for teaching all subjects, face challenges in developing expertise in music education.

Nevertheless, an elementary school teacher in Korea should possess a deep understanding of elementary education and expertise in music education, encompassing content, methods, and the ability to play musical instruments. Therefore, both Korea and the United States must continually work to enhance the system for nurturing and selecting elementary school music teachers more efficiently. Specifically, they should focus on institutional improvements tailored to Korea's unique context, where elementary school music teachers do not hold a distinct position.

This study aims to contribute to the enhancement of the system for nurturing elementary music teachers in Korea by comparing the selection methods for pre-service music teachers between the two countries. The researcher seeks to achieve three primary objectives: first, identifying the differences between the methods of selecting pre-service teachers in Korea and the United States; second, analyzing the potential impact of these differences on school music education; and third, proposing improvements to the Korean pre-service teacher selection method.

In Korea, there are 10 educational universities that train elementary school teachers. These universities are all national institutions with dedicated departments of music education for elementary school teachers. In contrast, the United States has teacher training institutions in general universities and colleges, with each state having its own setup. To ensure the efficiency of this research, 10 representative universities were selected from both countries (as shown in Table 1), following the same criteria: four-year public universities with a major in music teacher education and a moderate student body size.

Table 1: Universities subject to comparative analysis

South Korea	the U.S.
Busan National University of Education	Arkansas State University
Cheongju National University of Education	Ball State University
Chinju National University of Education	Bowling Green State University
Chuncheon National University of Education	CUNY Queens College of New York
Daegu National University of Education	Kansas State University
Gongju National University of Education	Minnesota State University, Mankoto
Gyeonin National University of Education	Pittsburg State University
Gwangju National University of Education	South Dakota State University
Jeonju National University of Education	University of Maine
Seoul National University of Education	University of North Carolina, Greensboro

2. OBJECTIVE AND PROBLEM OF THE STUDY

The primary objective of this paper is to address the following research questions:

1. To investigate and analyze the selection systems for elementary school music teachers in both Korea and the United States.
2. To conduct a comparative study, highlighting the similarities and differences between the selection systems for elementary school music teachers in Korea and the United States.
3. To derive meaningful implications and insights through a thorough comparative analysis of the two countries' elementary school music teacher selection systems.

The study seeks to shed light on the processes and criteria utilized in each country for selecting pre-service music teachers at the elementary level. By examining the respective systems, the paper aims to identify the key similarities and differences between Korea and the United States. Through this comparative analysis, the study intends to offer valuable insights that can lead to potential improvements in the selection and preparation of elementary school music teachers, especially in the Korean context. By addressing these objectives, the research aims to contribute to the enhancement of the overall music education system in elementary schools, benefiting both students and teachers in both countries.

3. THE CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK AND LIMITATION OF THE STUDY

3.1. Conceptual Framework

This study adopts an international comparative approach to examine the student selection methods for entering a college and becoming elementary music teachers in Korea and the United States. The research focuses on two main aspects:

1. Admission Requirements to Enter a Department of Music Education: This aspect involves analyzing the criteria and prerequisites set by universities in both countries for students aspiring to pursue a major in music education. The study aims to identify the key factors considered in the admission process, such as academic qualifications, musical aptitude, extracurricular achievements, and any specific music-related competencies.
2. Admission Process in College of Education Focused on Music and Music Education: The second aspect involves a detailed examination of the admission process at colleges of education that specifically emphasize music and music education. This includes understanding the selection criteria used for pre-service music teachers and the various stages of the selection process, such as entrance exams, interviews, and evaluations of candidates' potential and passion for music education.

To address the research problem and achieve the objectives, the researcher undertook a comprehensive review and investigation of information available on the official websites of universities in Korea and the United States. This data collection process occurred between October 5 to 10, 2022. Additionally, a literature comparison analysis was conducted to supplement the findings from the web-site reviews.

3.2. Limitation of the Study

This study on the education system for elementary school music teachers in Korea and the United States acknowledges several limitations, which may impact the generalizability of its findings:

1. Variation in Qualification Requirements: In the United States, the qualifications for becoming an elementary school music teacher may vary among the 50 states, and each university may have different criteria for musical performance levels or instruments required as a pre-service elementary school music teacher. This diversity in qualification requirements can introduce significant variations in the selection and training process, making it challenging to draw universal conclusions.
2. Diverse Training Institutions: Unlike Korea, where the government has established and nurtured 10 dedicated

universities for elementary school teacher training, the United States allows both private and public universities to train pre-service elementary school teachers, resulting in a wide range of institutions with diverse curricula. This diversity in training institutions can lead to discrepancies in the preparation and selection of music teachers.

3. Difference in Department Structure: In the United States, music colleges and music education departments are often separate entities, with distinct focuses and specializations. However, in Korea, elementary school music education departments are integrated into colleges of education rather than being part of music colleges. This structural difference may impact the emphasis and approach to music teacher training between the two countries.

4. Limited Scope of Qualification: In the United States, graduating from the Department of Music Education typically grants qualification to teach music from kindergarten to 12th grade (K-12). In contrast, graduating from a Korean college of education only qualifies individuals to teach music in elementary school. This difference in scope may influence the depth and breadth of music education provided to students.

5. Cultural and Contextual Differences: The selection systems for music teachers in Korea and the United States may be influenced by cultural, educational, and societal factors unique to each country. As such, comparing these systems may require careful consideration of the diverse contexts in which they operate.

Due to these significant differences in the education systems between Korea and the United States, the results of this study may not be easily generalized to other countries or contexts. The unique characteristics of each country's education system necessitate caution when applying the findings to other settings. Researchers and policy-makers should consider these limitations while interpreting the study's results and be mindful of the specific cultural, institutional, and structural contexts that may influence music teacher selection and preparation in different regions. Despite these limitations, this international comparative study endeavors to offer valuable insights into the selection processes for elementary music teachers in Korea and the United States, enabling a better understanding of potential areas for improvement and mutual learning between the two countries.

3.3. Research Procedure and Data Collection

The research methodology employed in this study involves a combination of literature review and data collection from selected universities' web-sites. The data collection process occurred during the period of 2022 to 2023, focusing on the curriculum and freshman recruitment methods available on the research target universities' web-sites.

For the Korean context, there are 10 educational universities known to offer elementary school teacher training programs. However, due to the similarity in the number of departments, methods of recruiting new students, curriculum, and other teacher training systems among these universities, the study chose to focus on one representative university to represent the Korean system.

As for the United States, the elementary teacher education program is typically established in universities, and completion of this program leads to the qualification of an elementary school teacher. In particular, colleges offering music education programs tend to have similar entrance qualifications and curriculum. For the purpose of research and analysis, one representative university from the United States was selected to represent the American system.

The data collection process involved reviewing the information published on the universities' official web-sites. The research target universities' web-sites were thoroughly analyzed, and relevant data pertaining to the admission requirements for the music education department and the admission process for pre-service music teachers were extracted and reviewed.

By employing a research procedure that combines literature review and data collection from universities' web-sites, the study aims to gain comprehensive insights into the selection methods for pre-service music teachers in both Korea and the United States. By focusing on representative universities from each country, the study endeavors to draw meaningful comparisons between the two systems, offering valuable implications for the

improvement of the elementary school music teacher selection process in Korea.

4. SELECTION SYSTEM OF KOREAN PRE-SERVICE MUSIC TEACHERS

4.1. Basic Requirements and Evaluation for Selection

The eligibility criteria for applying to colleges of education in Korea to become a pre-service elementary music teacher generally require applicants to be high school graduates or possess an equivalent or higher academic background recognized by law. The evaluation method may slightly vary depending on the admission process or the specific universities of education. However, most Korean universities of education typically consider three main evaluation factors during the selection process:

1. Academic Competency: Applicants' academic achievements, such as their high school grades, standardized test scores, and any relevant academic accomplishments, are evaluated to assess their academic competency.
2. Teaching Suitability and Potential: This factor assesses the applicant's suitability for a teaching career, looking into their aptitude and potential as future educators in the elementary school setting.
3. Teaching Personality: Universities also evaluate the teaching personality of the candidates, which includes assessing various personal characteristics and traits that are deemed essential for successful teaching, such as communication skills, patience, adaptability, and empathy.

Moreover, six evaluation items are commonly considered during the first stage of evaluation:

1. Academic Achievement: The applicant's academic performance and achievements throughout their educational journey.
2. Interest and Enthusiasm for Teaching: The candidate's level of interest, passion, and commitment towards pursuing a teaching career.
3. Creative Problem-Solving Ability and Diversity of Experiences: The ability to think creatively and handle challenges, as well as diverse experiences that may contribute to effective teaching.
4. Community Awareness and Interpersonal Skills: Evaluation of the candidate's awareness of community needs and their interpersonal skills to interact with students, parents, and colleagues.
5. Sharing and Consideration: Assessing the candidate's ability to share knowledge and consider the needs of others, which are vital qualities for an elementary school music teacher.
6. Responsibility and Integrity: Evaluating the candidate's sense of responsibility and integrity, which are crucial aspects of a teacher's professional conduct.

In the second stage of the evaluation process, interviews are conducted to further assess and select candidates who will be admitted as pre-service music teachers to teach in elementary schools. The interview stage allows universities to gain a deeper understanding of the candidates' motivations, aspirations, teaching philosophy, and potential to excel as future educators in the music subject.

Table 2: Eligibility and Basic Requirements in Korea

	Eligibility	Basic requirements
all Universities of Education, Korea	High school graduates (expected) or those recognized as having equivalent or	- Documents required for each applicant with applications

	higher academic background by law	- High school life record (including subject/non-subject parts)
--	-----------------------------------	---

As mentioned in Table 2, it appears that there are no specific basic requirements for college admissions or an explicit evaluation process to assess the musical proficiency of applicants in the selection system for pre-service elementary music teachers in Korea. Instead, evaluators may refer to the contents of the music courses completed during the high school student life record when conducting interviews or assessments.

It is worth noting that the absence of explicit requirements related to musical proficiency during the selection process might impact the evaluation of candidates' preparedness and competence in music education. Relying solely on high school music course records may not provide a comprehensive picture of an applicant's musical aptitude, practical skills, and passion for music education.

To ensure the effective preparation of pre-service elementary music teachers, it could be beneficial to consider incorporating specific measures to evaluate applicants' musical proficiency during the admission process. This could involve assessing their musical background, instrumental or vocal abilities, previous music experiences, and any additional qualifications related to music education. Such considerations could further strengthen the selection system and ensure that aspiring elementary music teachers possess the necessary skills and knowledge to excel in their future teaching roles.

As evident from Table 3, there is a distinct difference between Korea and the United States in terms of the admission requirements related to music skill or knowledge for aspiring elementary school music teachers.

In Korea, there are no specific requirements for taking music-related classes in high school or demonstrating music-related theory proficiency or practical auditions during the admission process to universities of education. This means that individuals with limited or no prior knowledge of music can still enter a college of education and pursue a career as a pre-service elementary school teacher. The absence of music-related requirements in the admission process allows for a broader pool of applicants to pursue a teaching career, even if they have limited musical skills or experience.

On the other hand, American universities typically have more stringent admission requirements for aspiring elementary school music teachers. In the United States, some universities may conduct music placement exams and auditions related to music to assess the musical abilities and skills of candidates. These requirements ensure that candidates entering the music education program possess a certain level of musical proficiency, enabling them to effectively teach music in elementary schools.

The contrast in admission requirements reflects the different approaches taken by the two countries when preparing pre-service elementary school music teachers. While the Korean system allows for a more inclusive approach by admitting candidates without specific musical abilities, the American system places greater emphasis on ensuring that candidates have a strong foundation in music to effectively teach the subject in schools.

Considering these differences, it becomes essential to understand how each country's approach impacts the quality of music education in elementary schools and whether additional measures might be beneficial to strengthen the preparation of pre-service elementary music teachers in Korea.

4.2. Requirements Related to Music Skill or Knowledge

There is absolutely no requirement that you have to take music-related classes in high school to be admitted to a university of education in Korea. None of the universities of education in Korea require a music-related theory test or practical audition. This means that even without prior knowledge of music, one can enter a college of education and become an elementary school preparatory teacher. Even if the pre-service teacher cannot distinguish the pitch, beat, or rhythm well, there is no problem at all in entering the school. Admission is possible even if you cannot play a musical instrument. Table 3 shows that Korea and the United States show a clear difference in the admission

requirements for elementary school music teachers. Unlike American universities that require music placement exams and auditions related to music, Korea does not require any musical ability.

Table 3: Prior any requirements related to music ability in Korea

	Prior any requirements related to music ability
All national universities of education, Korea	<input type="checkbox"/> None

5. SELECTION SYSTEM OF THE U.S. ELEMENTARY PRE-SERVICE MUSIC TEACHERS

5.1. Basic Requirements and Evaluation for Selection

Similar to Korea, the United States also grants entrance examination qualifications to individuals who have graduated from high school or are expected to graduate. However, the basic requirements for admission differ significantly from those of Korea. The details of the basic requirements for U.S. elementary pre-service music teachers are outlined in Table 4.

In the United States, basic requirements for admission typically include:

- 1.High School Academic Record: Applicants are required to submit their high school academic records, which include information about the courses attempted and completed during their high school education. This helps universities assess the academic background and performance of candidates.
- 2.Essay: Candidates are often asked to provide an essay as part of their application. The essay allows applicants to express their motivations, aspirations, and personal experiences related to becoming an elementary school music teacher. It provides insights into the candidate's passion for music education and their potential as future educators.
- 3.Academic Recommendation Letter: Applicants are usually required to submit at least one academic recommendation letter from a teacher or counselor who can attest to their academic abilities, character, and potential for success in higher education.
- 4.SAT or ACT Test Scores: In some cases, universities may require applicants to submit their SAT or ACT test scores, which are standardized tests used to assess a student's readiness for college. However, it is worth noting that during the coronavirus pandemic, some institutions may have waived the submission of standardized test scores.

While both Korea and the United States share the eligibility criteria for university admission (i.e., high school graduates or graduation candidates), the basic requirements for admission differ between the two countries. The U.S. selection system places a strong emphasis on the evaluation of academic records, essays, and recommendation letters, along with the optional submission of standardized test scores, allowing universities to assess applicants' academic readiness, personal qualities, and potential for success as pre-service elementary music teachers.

Table 4: Eligibility and basic requirements in the U.S.

	Eligibility	Basic requirements
All Universities and Colleges, the U.S.	High school graduates (expected)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Entire academic record (transcripts) including attempted and completed courses 2. usually An essay 3. At least one academic recommendation letter 4. usually SAT/ACT test score

5.2. Requirements Related to Music Skill or Knowledge

As illustrated in Table 5, there is a clear contrast between Korea and the United States in terms of requirements related to music skill or knowledge in the admissions process for pre-service elementary music teachers.

In the United States, all colleges and universities that offer music education programs typically require applicants to undergo an audition with a classical instrument as part of the admissions process. This audition serves as an important assessment of the candidate's musical abilities and proficiency, providing insights into their instrumental skills, technique, and overall musical aptitude. Additionally, some institutions may also require applicants to take a music placement test, which further evaluates their theoretical knowledge and understanding of music concepts.

These rigorous requirements in the United States highlight the emphasis placed on the musical abilities and knowledge of aspiring elementary school music teachers. By incorporating auditions and music placement tests, universities ensure that candidates possess a strong foundation in music and are well-prepared to teach music in an educational setting.

In contrast, as previously mentioned, Korea does not have specific exam or audition requirements to check students' music-related abilities in the admissions process for pre-service elementary music teachers. This approach allows for a more inclusive selection system, enabling individuals without prior music knowledge to enter colleges of education and pursue a teaching career.

Considering these differences, it is evident that the selection systems in the United States and Korea take contrasting approaches to evaluating the musical abilities and preparation of applicants for music education programs. While the U.S. system seeks to ensure that candidates possess a high level of musical proficiency, the Korean system focuses on providing opportunities for a broader pool of candidates to pursue teaching careers, even without prior musical expertise. Each approach has its advantages and may reflect the respective countries' priorities and goals in preparing pre-service elementary music teachers.

Table 5: Prior requirements related to music ability in the U.S

the U.S.	Music placement exam(test)	Audition
Arkansas State University	X	O
Ball State University	X	O
Bowling Green State University	O	O
CUNY Queens College of New York	O	O
Kansas State University	X	O
Minnesota State University, Mankato	O	O
Pittsburg State University	X	O
South Dakota State University	O	O
University of Maine	X	O
University of North Carolina, Greensboro	X	O

The inclusion of placement tests and live auditions as part of the admissions process at Bowling Green State University, CUNY Queens College of New York, Minnesota State University, Mankato, and South Dakota State University reflects their emphasis on evaluating applicants' musical abilities and knowledge thoroughly.

The live audition serves as a critical component of the admission process, allowing the universities to directly assess candidates' musical skills, instrumental or vocal abilities, technique, and overall performance aptitude. It provides a firsthand evaluation of the candidates' readiness and potential to excel as pre-service elementary music teachers.

On the other hand, the placement test complements the audition by further gauging the level of musical ability of

applicants. This test assists in determining the candidates' current level of musical competency, helping universities to tailor their coursework and educational experiences to suit the individual needs of each student. By utilizing placement tests, universities can ensure that students are appropriately placed in courses that match their musical proficiency, enabling them to receive the most effective and suitable music education during their studies.

The combined use of auditions and placement tests in the admissions process of these universities demonstrates their commitment to maintaining high standards of musical proficiency and pedagogical preparation among pre-service elementary music teachers. Such comprehensive evaluation methods contribute to producing well-qualified and skilled music educators who are equipped to deliver quality music education in elementary schools.

These examples also highlight the diversity of admission requirements across different universities in the United States, reflecting the variety of approaches taken by institutions to prepare future elementary music teachers. Each university's specific criteria and evaluation methods may be influenced by their educational philosophy, resources, and goals in producing competent music educators for the education system.

Table 6: Prior requirements related to music ability in the U.S.

	Prior requirements related to music ability
Queens College, CUNY, the U.S.	1. music placement exam 2. audition (one of 17 classic areas), except commercial music ("pop music")

As shown in Table 6 and Table 7, the university has a comprehensive selection process that includes both a music placement exam and an audition.

Table 7 outlines the six components of the music placement test, which assess various aspects of an applicant's musical abilities and knowledge:

1. Rudiments: This component evaluates the applicant's understanding of music fundamentals, such as notation, key signatures, time signatures, and basic music theory concepts.
2. Melodic Dictation: Candidates are tested on their ability to listen to and transcribe melodic passages, which measures their ear-training skills and ability to identify pitch and intervals.
3. General Knowledge of Music: This part assesses the applicant's overall knowledge of music history, theory, and styles, demonstrating their broader understanding of the subject.
4. Sight-singing: Applicants are evaluated on their capacity to read and perform music at first sight, indicating their proficiency in sight-reading and vocal skills.
5. Keyboard Skills: This component tests the candidate's ability to play the keyboard, which can be essential for music educators in elementary schools.
6. Brief Test in a Voice or an Instrument: This portion requires candidates to perform a short piece on their chosen voice or instrument, demonstrating their proficiency and skill in their specific musical domain.

Moreover, Table 7 shows that the audition component of the admissions process at Queens College, CUNY, includes 17 classical instrument fields. Applicants are required to audition on their selected instrument, which can be strings (violin, viola, cello, double-bass, and guitar), winds (flute, clarinet, oboe, and bassoon), brass (trumpet,

trombone, tuba, horn, and saxophone), piano, percussion, or voice.

The rigorous evaluation of musical abilities through both the placement test and the audition underscores the university's commitment to selecting highly skilled and qualified pre-service elementary music teachers. By assessing various aspects of an applicant's musicianship and performance abilities, Queens College, CUNY, ensures that its music education program admits candidates who are well-prepared to excel in teaching music in elementary schools.

Table 7: Queens College's audition and placement exam

Audition and placement exam details of Queens College, CUNY	
Placement exam (all applicants)	<input type="checkbox"/> Rudiments, Melodic dictation, General knowledge of music, Sight-singing, Keyboard skills, a brief test in voice or an instrument
Audition instruments (one of them)	String violin, viola, cello, double-bass, guitar
	Wind flute, clarinet, oboe, bassoon
	Brass trumpet, trombone, tuba, horn, saxophone
	Piano
	Percussion
	Voice

5.3. Instrument Audition Level

Indeed, the admission process for music education programs in the U.S. places a strong emphasis on the level of instrumental or vocal proficiency demonstrated by candidates during the audition.

As you mentioned, applicants are expected to showcase a certain level of quality and mastery on their chosen instrument rather than merely having tried an instrument. This expectation ensures that admitted candidates have a solid foundation in their instrumental skills and are well-equipped to handle the demands of teaching music to elementary school students effectively.

For example, if an applicant auditions with the bassoon, they are typically required to perform one movement from a concerto, which is a substantial and challenging piece of music, and two contrasting etudes (practice pieces). Similar expectations apply to applicants auditioning with other instruments. The audition requirements may vary slightly for each instrument, but the common thread is that applicants must demonstrate a high level of playing ability on their instrument to be considered for admission.

By demanding a certain level of instrumental or vocal proficiency during the audition, universities ensure that their music education programs attract and admit candidates who have the necessary technical and artistic skills to excel in teaching music. This ensures that future elementary school music teachers are well-prepared to provide high-quality music education to their students, inspiring a passion for music and fostering musical growth in the classroom.

The rigorous audition process also helps maintain a standard of excellence within the music education field, fostering the development of competent and skilled music educators who can positively impact the lives of their students through the power of music.

Table 8: Queens College's audition requirements

Instrument	Audition requirements for each instrument
Queens College, CUNY, violin, viola, cello	<input type="checkbox"/> One movement of a major concerto, OR sonata, contemporary work <input type="checkbox"/> Two contrasting movements of Solo Bach(for each string pieces)

the U.S.	Doublebass	<input type="checkbox"/> Major or minor scale and arpeggio, 2 octaves <input type="checkbox"/> Two contrasting movements of a baroque sonata, or first movement of a standard concerto and an additional contrasting movement or work <input type="checkbox"/> One etude on the level of Bille, Simandi, Storch-Hrabe, or Sturm. <input type="checkbox"/> One orchestral excerpt of the applicant's choice
	Flute, Oboe	<input type="checkbox"/> One movement from a Concerto <input type="checkbox"/> One other contrasting piece <input type="checkbox"/> One etude
	Clarinet, Bassoon, Horn, Trumpet, Trombone, Tuba	<input type="checkbox"/> One movement from a Concerto <input type="checkbox"/> Two contrasting etudes
	Piano	<input type="checkbox"/> All major and minor scales and arpeggios in four octaves, hands together <input type="checkbox"/> Two pieces in contrasting styles, chosen from the Baroque, Classical, Romantic, Impressionistic, or 20 th Century eras (Single movements of sonatas are acceptable, but the movement chosen, or each piece chosen, must be presented and prepared in their entirety, not partially) <input type="checkbox"/> Sight-reading
	Percussion	<input type="checkbox"/> Snare drum solo work and rudiments <input type="checkbox"/> A solo on a mallet instrument (usually Marimba) plus all scales <input type="checkbox"/> A Timpani solo and tuning exercises
	Voice	<input type="checkbox"/> One Italian Art Song <input type="checkbox"/> One English Art Song or musical theater selection <input type="checkbox"/> One traditional folk song * Commercial music ("pop music") not considered
	Guitar	<input type="checkbox"/> A technical study or composition by Sor, Aguado or Carcassi <input type="checkbox"/> A work from the Renaissance or Baroque period <input type="checkbox"/> A solo twentieth century composition

Indeed, the information presented in Table 8 highlights the substantial requirements for both music majors and music education majors in American universities. The inclusion of music-related placement exams and instrumental (including vocal music) auditions for both types of applicants demonstrates the importance placed on musical proficiency and readiness for future music educators.

The content that music education applicants need to prepare musically is both qualitatively and quantitatively significant, emphasizing the need for a strong musical foundation in these individuals. By requiring music education applicants to undergo rigorous auditions and placement exams, universities ensure that these aspiring music educators possess the necessary musical skills and knowledge to effectively teach music in elementary schools.

Applicants who are well-equipped in their musical instruments and demonstrate high levels of musicianship during the audition process are more likely to be considered competent in the musical aspect of their teaching. This competence is crucial as music education majors are tasked with imparting musical knowledge and skills to their future students in the classroom.

By setting high standards for music education applicants' musical abilities, American universities ensure that their music education programs produce well-prepared and capable music educators. These educators can make a significant impact on their students' musical development and foster a love and appreciation for music in the school environment.

The comprehensive and demanding requirements for music education majors reflect the commitment of American universities to provide quality music education and prepare future teachers who can deliver engaging and effective music instruction in elementary schools. By upholding these standards, universities contribute to the overall enhancement of music education and enrich the lives of students through the power of music.

6. RESULTS

6.1. Comparison of Selection Criteria

In the selection of pre-service teachers, both Korea and the United States apply general criteria for qualifications applicable to universities. Both Korean and American universities require eligibility for applicants who have graduated from high school or have equivalent qualifications, and they typically request high school transcripts or life records to assess academic performance. In the past, U.S. universities commonly required SAT/ACT scores, but there has been a recent trend of not requesting these scores from applicants due to the impact of the coronavirus pandemic. On the other hand, Korean universities do not require college scholastic ability test scores in the 'Susi' admission process, but they are required for the 'Jungsi' admission process.

6.2. Differences in Auditions for Music Education Majors

One of the significant differences found in this study between Korean and American universities that operate music education departments is whether or not there is an audition in the selection of pre-service music teachers. In the case of Korean universities, all educational institutions do not conduct tests or auditions to measure any musical aptitude or ability among applicants for the Department of Music Education.

Contrarily, American universities that offer music education programs require applicants to demonstrate a significant level of musical knowledge and instrumental skills through auditions. Auditions are mandatory for all American universities that train music teachers, and although applicants can choose their instruments, they are typically limited to classical instruments. Moreover, the level of performance in the audition is required to meet certain standards.

6.3. Utilization of Placement Exams

In addition to auditions, some American universities also utilize placement exams in their selection process for music education majors. The placement exam helps assess applicants' musical readiness and guides the curriculum planning within the universities. These exams typically assess various aspects of musical proficiency, such as basic music knowledge, melodic dictation, sight-singing, and keyboard skills. The results of the placement exam assist in determining the appropriate level of coursework for each student to ensure their musical growth and development throughout the program.

6.4. Implications

The findings of this study indicate that the selection process for pre-service music teachers in the United States places significant importance on the musical aptitude and instrumental skills of applicants. This emphasis ensures that music education majors are well-prepared in the musical aspect and ready to undertake teaching responsibilities in schools. On the other hand, the selection process in Korea does not include music tests or auditions, allowing for a more inclusive approach to admitting candidates, even without prior musical experience.

The contrasting approaches in selection criteria between the two countries suggest potential implications for both systems. Korean universities may consider implementing measures, such as auditions or musical proficiency assessments, to ensure that music education applicants possess the necessary musical skills to effectively teach music in schools. On the other hand, American universities' use of auditions and placement exams could serve as a model for other countries to enhance the preparation of music education majors and raise the overall quality of music education in schools.

Overall, the study highlights the significance of the selection process in preparing competent and skilled music educators and the potential impact it can have on music education in elementary schools in both Korea and the United States.

7. DISCUSSION

The results of this study have revealed several important points of discussion concerning the differences between the music teacher education systems in the United States and Korea. Two main aspects warrant discussion: the advantages and disadvantages of the entry barriers for pre-service music teachers in both countries and the differences in the depth of music education curriculum between American and Korean universities.

7.1. Advantages and Disadvantages of Entry Barriers

In the United States, universities have high entry barriers for music education majors, requiring applicants to undergo auditions and demonstrate a certain level of musical proficiency on their chosen instrument. This approach ensures that admitted candidates possess strong musical skills and knowledge, setting a high standard for future music educators. The advantages of this system are that it produces competent and skilled music teachers who can effectively teach various aspects of music, such as instrumental performance, choral instruction, and music theory.

However, the disadvantage of this high entry barrier is that it may deter potential candidates who have a passion for teaching but lack advanced musical abilities. It could limit the pool of applicants and discourage some aspiring music educators from pursuing a career in teaching due to the rigorous musical demands.

On the other hand, Korean universities have a more inclusive approach, with no music-related tests or auditions for music education applicants. The advantage of this system is that it allows a broader range of candidates to pursue a teaching career in music education, irrespective of their prior musical experience. It encourages individuals with a passion for teaching to enter the field of music education.

However, the disadvantage of this approach is that it may result in some pre-service music teachers lacking sufficient musical skills and knowledge to teach effectively. The absence of music-related entry barriers could lead to challenges in maintaining consistent quality among music educators in elementary schools.

7.2. Differences in Music Education Curriculum

American universities offer a comprehensive and in-depth music education curriculum that covers a wide range of subjects and prepares future music educators for various teaching roles. The advantage of this system is that it ensures music education majors are well-equipped to teach multiple instruments, lead choirs, orchestras, and bands, and teach music theory effectively. It produces well-rounded and versatile music educators.

However, the limitation of the Korean education system, which operates with a smaller curriculum, is that it may result in a narrower focus on specific aspects of music education. This limitation could lead to challenges in adequately preparing music education majors to handle the diverse range of teaching responsibilities they may encounter in elementary schools.

7.3. Overcoming Differences

To overcome the differences between the two systems, Korean universities could consider implementing audition processes for music education applicants among the admitted freshmen. This would allow them to identify candidates with strong musical talent and potential for further development. Additionally, providing private instruction on instruments as an extracurricular option and requiring recitals before graduation could help enhance the musical abilities of pre-service music teachers.

Regarding the differences in the depth of the music education curriculum, the government's role becomes

crucial. A decision needs to be made on whether to prioritize increasing the professionalism of music education for elementary school teachers or continue with the current system where teachers teach multiple subjects. If the goal is to elevate the quality of music education, then the government may need to consider providing additional support and resources to expand the music education curriculum in universities of education.

In conclusion, both the United States and Korea have distinct advantages and disadvantages in their approaches to selecting and preparing pre-service music teachers. By analyzing and considering these differences, both countries can work towards improving the quality of music education and nurturing competent and dedicated music educators for the future.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, this study focused on the training and selection of pre-service music teachers in Korea and the United States through an international comparative analysis. The findings reveal significant differences between the two countries in their approach to nurturing music teachers for elementary schools.

The study highlights that all 10 universities of education in Korea do not require any prior musical knowledge, musical aptitude, or instrumental skills for applicants to the Department of Music Education. This inclusive approach allows a wide range of candidates to pursue a teaching career in music education. However, it also raises concerns about the preparedness and proficiency of pre-service music teachers, given the absence of music-related entry barriers.

On the other hand, the music education departments of the 10 universities in the United States require all applicants to undergo auditions, indicating a higher entry barrier. This approach ensures that admitted candidates possess a significant level of musical knowledge and instrumental skills, setting a standard for future music educators. However, it may also deter some potential candidates who have a passion for teaching but lack advanced musical abilities.

The study calls for careful consideration and discussion about the advantages and disadvantages of both approaches. For Korea, potential alternatives could involve implementing auditions or musical proficiency assessments for music education applicants from among the admitted students to ensure that candidates have the necessary musical skills for effective teaching. Providing extracurricular options for private instruction on instruments and requiring recitals could also enhance the musical abilities of pre-service music teachers.

Moreover, the differences in the depth of the music education curriculum between American and Korean universities highlight the importance of government involvement in shaping the teacher education system. A clear decision is needed on whether to prioritize increasing the professionalism of music education or maintaining the current system where teachers handle multiple subjects in elementary schools. Additional support and resources may be necessary to expand the music education curriculum in Korean universities.

Ultimately, the study emphasizes the crucial role of teachers in influencing the successful implementation of educational policies and the need for continuous research and reform in teacher training systems to improve the quality of education globally. By addressing the challenges and implementing appropriate solutions, both Korea and the United States can work towards nurturing competent and skilled music educators who will positively impact the lives of their students through the power of music.

REFERENCES

- [1] Abeles, H. F., Hoffer, C. R., & Klotman, R. H. (1994). *Foundations of music education*. Schirmer books.
- [2] Arkansas State University, Department of Music. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.astate.edu/college/liberal-arts/departments/music/>
- [3] Ball State University, School of Music. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.bsu.edu/academics/collegesanddepartments/music>
- [4] Bowling Green State University. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.bgsu.edu/catalog/colleges-and-1504>

programs/college-of-musical-arts/music-education

- [5] Busan National University of Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.bnue.ac.kr/Home/Contents>
- [6] Cheongju National University of Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.cje.ac.kr/web/main.do>
- [7] Chinju National University of Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.cue.ac.kr/kor/Main.do>
- [8] Cho, D. H. (2021). A Study on the Germany's Training System of Music Teachers. *Korean Journal of Arts Education*, 19(2), 117-132.
- [9] Chuncheon National University of Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.cnue.ac.kr/cnue/info/curriculum.do>
- [10] Daegu National University of Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.dnue.ac.kr/kor/Main.do>
- [11] Gongju National University of Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.gjue.ac.kr/gjue/kor.do>
- [12] Gordon, E. E. (2007). *Learning sequences in music: a contemporary learning theory*. Chicago, IL: GIA Publications, Inc.
- [13] Gordon, E. E. (2005). *Music aptitude and related test, an introduction*. Chicago, IL: GIA Publications, Inc.
- [14] Gyeongin National University of Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.ginue.ac.kr/kor/Main.do>
- [15] Gwangju National University of Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.gnue.ac.kr/index.9is>
- [16] Hargreaves, D. J. (1986). *The developmental psychology of music*. England: Cambridge University Press.
- [17] Higher Education Act Title II Reporting System (2015). *Pathways to teaching*. U.S. Department of Education, Office of Postsecondary Education. Data as of February 26, 2015.
- [18] Jam, F. A., Singh, S. K. G., Ng, B., & Aziz, N. (2016). Interactive effects of Gender and Leadership Styles on Open Service Innovation: A Study of Malaysian Doctors, *International Journal of Economics Research*, 13(3), 1287-1304.
- [19] Hong, S. Y. (2021). A Study of the Teacher's Guide Book for the Music Text Book Based on Gordon's Music Learning Theory. *Journal of Music Education Science*, 46, 103-126
- [20] Hong, S. Y. (2014). A preliminary study on the Comparison of Singing Teaching between Korea and the United States in Elementary School. *Journal of Ewha Music Research Institute*, 18(2), 94-114.
- [21] Hong, S. Y. (2012). Creativity in Music Education: An Investigation of Elementary School Teachers' Understanding. *Journal of Ewha Music Research Institute*, 16(2), 8-27.
- [22] Jang, S. O. (2021). Trends of Early Childhood Pre-Service Teachers' Research Related to Self-Efficacy. *Korean Association for Learner-centered Curriculum and Instruction*, 21(1), 685-687.
- [23] Jeonju National University of Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.jnue.ac.kr/kor/Main.do>
- [24] Kansas State University, Department of Music Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.k-state.edu/musiceducation/>
- [25] Korea Institute for Curriculum and Evaluation (K.I.C.E.). (2015). *International Comparison of Teacher of Training and Appointment Systems*. 2015 KICE Issue Paper, ORM 2015-50-30. 1-7.
- [26] Koh, S. A., Kim, M. J., Kim, N. Y. (2019). A Study on Pre-service Early Childhood Teacher's Music Self-concept and Music Teaching Efficacy according as Experiences related to Music. *Korean Association for Learner-centered Curriculum and Instruction*, 19(21), 995-998.
- [27] Lee, A. H. (2020). A Comparison Study of Elementary Teacher Preparation Programs in South Korea and the United States, and Implication for Future Curriculum to Improve Teacher Competency in Teaching Inclusive Classroom. *The Journal of Inclusive Education*, 15(2), 29-58.
- [28] Lee, D. N., Ju, D. C., & Kloppenburg, J. (2003). A Comparative Study of Education System for Elementary School Music Teacher in Korea and Germany. *Korean Journal of Elementary Education*, 14(1), 95-130.
- [29] Lee, P.G., K, M.J., Zhao, X., & Hwang, J.H. (2021). Exploring the Relationship between the Professionalism of Elementary School Teachers and the Training System and Course. *Korean Journal of Elementary Education*, 34(4), 83-106.
- [30] Jam, F. A., Haq, I. U., & Fatima, T. (2012). Psychological contract and job outcomes: Mediating role of affective commitment. *Journal of Educational and Social Research*, 2(4), 79-79.
- [31] Lim, E. J. (2015). Significant Influences of School Music Experiences on One's Musical Development during School Years and Beyond. *Research in Music Pedagogy*, 15, 201.
- [32] Ministry of Education. (2019). *2019 Teacher Qualification Test Practical Handbook*. Sejong, Korea.
- [33] Minnesota State University Mankato, Music Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://hss.mnsu.edu/academic-programs/music/music-degree-programs/music-education-program/>
- [34] Moon, J. Y. (2008). A Study on the Relation of Gender, Age, and Musical Experience with Emotional Response to Music. *Music and Culture*, 19, 158-160. <https://doi.org/10.17091/kswm.2008..19.147>
- [35] Pittsburg State University, Music Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://academics.pittstate.edu/academic-programs/music/music-education-degree-emphasis.html>
- [36] Queens College, Aaron Copland School of Music. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.qc.cuny.edu/academics/music/>
- [37] Reimer, B. (1989). *A Philosophy of Music Education*, Englewood Cliff, NJ: Prentice-Hall. 14.
- [38] Seoul National University of Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://www.snue.ac.kr/snue/main.do>
- [39] Swanwick, K. (1973). Musical cognition and aesthetic response. *Psychology of Music*, 1(2), 7-13. <https://doi.org/10.1177/030573567312001>

- [40] Trousdale, A. & Bach, E. Willis, E. (2010). Freedom, physicality, friendship and feeling: Aspects of children's spirituality expressed through the choral reading of poetry. *International Journal of children's spirituality*, 15(4). 317-329. doi.org/10.1080/1364436x.2010.529874
- [41] Tulang, M. D. . (2023). Cultivating Early Childhood Success: Kindergarten Teachers' Professional Needs, Experiences, Efficacy Beliefs, and Performance. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(3), 719-742. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i3.1595>
- [42] University of Maine, Music Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://go.umaine.edu/music-education/>
- [43] University of North Carolina at Greensboro, Music Education. (2022). Website. Retrieved October 10, 2022, from <https://vpa.uncg.edu/music/degrees-and-programs/areas-of-study/music-education/>
- [44] Yoon, G. K. (2018a). A Study on the Correlation between Music Performance Stress and Elementary Pre-Service Teacher's Music Education Self-Efficacy. *Korean Journal of Research in Music Education*. 45(1). 139-141. <https://doi.org/10.30775/kmes.47.1.06>
- [45] Yoon, G. K. (2018b). A Study on the Correlations Between Elementary Pre-Service Teacher's Music Subject Self-Efficacy and Previous Experience about Music Education. *Korean Journal of Research in Music Education*. 45(4). 129-131.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i3.1732>

This is an open access article licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>), which permits unrestricted, non-commercial use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the work is properly cited.