

# Implementation of Sustainable Performance Management of Government Institution: A Case Study in Indonesia

Dr. Didid Noordiatmoko, M.M.<sup>1\*</sup>. Assoc. Prof Dr. in Law., Dr. in Criminolog., Drs. Bambang Slamet Riyadi. SH. MH. MM.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>*Universitas Indonesia. Lecturer at the Faculty of Administrative Sciences. Depok Campus, Indonesia. Lecturer at the Metrology Academy, Ministry of Trade of the Republic of Indonesia. E-mail: [noordiatmoko.fia.ui@gmail.com](mailto:noordiatmoko.fia.ui@gmail.com)*

<sup>2</sup>*Universitas Nasional, Faculty of Law. Jakarta and Lecturer in Program of Doctoral of Law. Universitas Jayabaya Jakarta. Indonesia.*

**Abstracts:** This research aimed to understand the implementation of sustainable performance management of government institutions that were significant at the ontological and sociological level. The problem was very interesting to be analyzed by conducting a qualitative research method based on public policy theory. Data were collected through in-depth interviews, observation, and documentation related to cases in Indonesia. Data analyzed using interactive models were data reduction, data display, data verification, and supported by triangulation. The results were based on the ontological and sociological levels using a public policy perspective to improve the implementation of sustainable performance management of government institution policy and practice. The vision and mission of public policy on managing policy are needed to provide stakeholders with information related to the regulations and sanctions. This research results provided inputs for improving regulations on the implementation of sustainable performance management of government institution policy in Indonesia for state agencies as public officials and practitioners.

**Keywords:** Public Policy, Performance Management, Sustainable.

## 1. INTRODUCTION

The implementation of the performance management system becomes effective in controlling government power. The performance management system ensures that the organization's performance will be easy to achieve its goals. The performance management system establishing collaboration between departments creates performance measures that reflect goals and provides performance information as an ingredient in providing services to the public.

The Ministry of Empowerment of State Apparatus and Bureaucratic Reform seeks to improve performance management both at the central and regional levels through the Government Agency Performance Accountability System based on Presidential Regulation Number 29 of 2014. The Government Agency Performance Accountability System is able to create effective performance management in every government agency. Implementation of the Performance Accountability System for Government Agencies is described in five components, namely 1) performance planning; 2) performance measurement; 3) performance reporting; 4) internal evaluation; and 5) performance achievements. With the Government Agency Performance Accountability System, every government agency will be able to assess how effective the implementation of performance management in government agencies is because the Government Agency Performance Accountability System can describe the quality of performance management implementation and build a better performance culture.

Based on the observation and information stated above, at the policy level, there are multiple interpretations of the implementation of sustainable performance management of government institution policy. At the implementation level, this will have implication for the implementation of sustainable performance management of government institution policies. This research aims to analyze the public policy on managing the implementation of sustainable performance management of government institution policies based on the public policy theory.

## 1.1. Background

Efforts to improve the quality of the implementation of the Performance Accountability System for Government Agencies in Government Agencies in Indonesia have had a positive impact. Among them is the increase in budget efficiency. The value of national budget efficiency has increased from 2017 to 2018. In addition to efficiency, there has been an increase in the trend of evaluation results nationally from 2016 to 2019. This improvement is an effort that should be appreciated because of the consistent improvement from year to year. This is certainly a good for the implementation of performance accountability in Indonesia. In addition, the number of government agencies with an increase in grade value also increases.

The implementation of the Government Agency Performance Accountability System from 2014-2020 is an achievement in managing performance management in Indonesia. However, the number of government agencies needs to be more progressive to increase, and there are even some government agencies that tend to decrease. Implementing the Government Agency Performance Accountability System also does not reflect the quality of good governance. The implementation of the Government Agency Performance Accountability System is still dominated by assessments of administrative documents, not yet dominated by results orientation.

Regulatory complexity has hampered the implementation of performance management, especially at the local government level. The inconsistency between regulations leaves unclear legal basis. In one hand, local governments must follow the rules and regulations of the Ministry of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform as the leading sector in performance management. On the other hand, local governments must also comply with regulations from the Ministry of Home Affairs as the coordinator of local governments. This situation shows that there is no mutual agreement and commitment regarding regulations that are used as the basis for implementing performance management. The central government still needs to focus on improving and sustaining performance management in Indonesia.

The human resource management and its implication provides inputs for making better regulation and policy (Toruan, Gusti, & Riyadi, 2023). Implementation of performance accountability system for government institution provides inputs for making better regulation on implementation of performance accountability system for public officials and practitioners (Priyambodo, Wijaya, Wike, Sujarwoto, & Riyadi, 2023a). The Performance Accountability System For Government Agency provides inputs for making better regulation on performance accountability system for government institution policy (Priyambodo, Wijaya, Wike, Sujarwoto, & Riyadi, 2023b). Transformational Leadership, Technology Adoption, Public Service have significant positive effect on Job Competency (Purbiantari, Zauhar, Suryadi, Hermawan, & Riyadi, 2023b). The leadership and service are useful for improving policy and practice and providing information to stakeholders (Purbiantari, Zauhar, Suryadi, Hermawan, & Riyadi, 2023a). The user satisfaction has a positive and significant effect on organizational performance (Sinulingga et al., 2023). Public Private Partnership policy and practice provide information to stakeholders related (Syahrudin, Wijaya, Suryono, & Riyadi, 2023). The role of Workplace Spirituality mediates effect of Information Technology on Innovative Work Behavior and mediates effect of Transformational Leadership on Innovative Work Behavior (Susilo, Astuti, Arifin, Mawardi, & Riyadi, 2023). The collaboration have to be involved the related institutions and should be conducted for making better regulation on disaster management (Tjahjono, Suryono, Riyanto, Amin, & Riyadi, 2023). Managing conflict strategy and its implementation are needed for providing information to stakeholders to provides inputs for making better regulation and policy (Toruan, Riyadi, & Gusti, 2023). Improving policy are needed for providing information and produce a clear input for public officials in making better regulations (Rozikin, Wijaya, & Riyadi, 2023). The community empowerment positively affected production capacity and social capital (Nuraini, Saleh, Wike, & Riyadi, 2023). The Collaborative Governance in Digital Infrastructure Development and its implementation are needed for providing information to stakeholders (Rozikin, Sulisty, Saleh, Hermawan, & Riyadi, 2023). It was necessary to formulate and implement a policy as inputs for making a better regulation in managing the implementation of policy (Sipayung, Sumartono, Saleh, Rozikin, & Riyadi, 2023a). The Content of Policy and Context of Implementation are positively affected the Program. The Collaborative Governance positively affect the Program (Sipayung, Sumartono, Saleh, Rozikin, & Riyadi, 2023b).

Based on the explanation above, there is no statutory level of regulation as a legal umbrella on managing the implementation of sustainable performance management of government institution policy. At a new level, it is necessary to have an analysis for implementing sustainable performance management of government institution policy. A deeper exploration of ontological and sociological levels is needed and this issue is very interesting to be studied. What are the supporting factors for sustainable performance management of government institutions in Indonesia? How is the sustainable performance management of government institution policy in Indonesia?

## 1.2. Research Objectives

This research is helpful for academicians and practitioners in adding knowledge about public policy theory. This research also serves as a recommendation for the legislative and executive as the public officials to make revisions and more detailed regulations on sustainable performance management of government institutions.

## 2. ORIGINAL RESEARCH

The necessity of public policy implemented by the government is oriented to the public interest. So, there is a paradigm shift in public services for public institutional organizations toward public satisfaction. This research explains that in Indonesia, which currently deals with the dynamics of globalization and an increasingly competitive economic environment, the government must act professionally so that it can reduce the negative impact on society. The demands of globalization today are not only a challenge for businesses, but also for the organizers of public administration since they must perform excellent services to meet the quality of life and welfare of the people. The concept of a paradigm shift in administration in the era of globalization as contained in the concept of the New Public Service needs to be carried out in various dimensions. The behavior of the bureaucracy and the quality of public service reorientation in the philosophy of state administration must prioritize aspects of effectiveness, economy, fairness, and responsiveness. Thus, through the actualization of the New Public Service in the administration of public services, it can change the quality of life and people's welfare for the better (Solong, 2017).

Park and Krause analyzed local government in collecting performance data and integrating it into sustainable management practices. Regular and systematic assessments aim to determine the extent to which efforts have been made to achieve performance objectives. Research findings show that a large number of local governments in the US are involved in sustainability performance assessment, but they have different capabilities to set appropriate indicators and significant supporting mechanisms for improving local, sustainable performance management (Park & Krause, 2021).

Bouloiz focused on continuous performance improvement, but a lot of glitches still occur due to unpredictable failures. Durability is the ability to withstand shock and maintain critical function, which has been recognized as an important approach to keeping it operational under various conditions. Specific management models that are able to define functions and constraints contribute to the resilience of sustainable performance. The resilience engineering model integrates sustainable development for performance management with several functions: the ability to anticipate, the ability to respond, and the ability to learn and survive (Bouloiz, 2020).

Agasisti, Agostino, and Soncin showed three different implementation patterns, namely formal compliance, shared vision and technical oligarchy in the context of power, communication, and a tendency to learn. Formal compliance is controlled by professional experts and it has limited internal commitment, so the implementation process is difficult to complete. Implementation of a shared vision involves many staff in local government in the learning and communication process. Technical oligarchy approach, centralized power, communication, and a tendency to learn are only limited to the middle class and internal groups (Agasisti, Agostino, & Soncin, 2020).

Fachete and Nedelcu provided an explanation of the importance of performance to support sustainable development through indicators used to assess sustainability aspects. Sustainable development implies concern for the simultaneous achievement of three categories of goals: economic, social, and environmental. Global performance objectives in industrial systems with several indicators used to assess sustainability aspects are production costs, quality, energy consumption, and safety (Fechete & Nedelcu, 2019).

There are 2 approaches to collaborative performance management. Inter-agency collaboration and intra-agency collaboration. There are several factors that strengthen intra-institutional collaboration, namely accountability for institutional goals and investment in institutional performance systems, which are still considered to weaken collaboration between institutions. However, other factors such as seniority, participation in goal setting, and goal salience can encourage both types of collaborative performance management. Senior managers have more commitment to collaborate in performance management. This practical implication highlights the importance of clear communication of the value and relevance of goals to encourage collaboration and involve managers in goal setting so that they feel more motivated to collaborate in achieving organizational goals (Choi & Moynihan, 2019).

Tseng and Levy states that performance management is an important human resource management practice to facilitate organizational performance. The performance management process can be improved by reducing formal procedures and improving manager-employee interactions. Managers operate the processes through their influence on employees, teams, and organizations. Performance management components at various levels use relational dynamics (Tseng & Levy, 2019).

Talent Management hybrid model based on 5 proposed conceptual models are Soft Skill Model, Hard Skill Model, Competency Model, Performance Model, and Success Model. A quantitative approach using the survey method was conducted to test models and hypotheses developed. The findings are as follows. Soft Skills has no influence on Talent Management. Hard Skills has a positive influence on Talent Management. Competency has a positive influence on Talent Management. Performance has a positive influence on Talent Management. Success has a positive influence on Talent Management. The results obtained would provide information to Indonesian civil advocates that are essential for the practice (Hendriarti, Othman, Arif, Assery, & Jamal, 2022)

The abuse of power in Indonesia has an impact on deviant actions that are not only under pressure from power, but also the moral behavior of public officials. Many public officials abuse power. They are punished by tough laws. There is a weak system when public officials who abuse power are people who do not have the view of life as a nation and state as it should be. Therefore, it is necessary to have a system by carrying out the collaborative practice (Riyadi, 2020b).

Abuse of power involves a lot of conflict of interests. Service policy must be controlled by the state for the greatest prosperity of the people. The conflict of interest to maintain power in service policy causes state losses and harm to the people. The components of change caused by modernization are subject to materialism and consumerism by ignoring cultural values in state life. It takes cultural morality and limits the extent of that power (Riyadi, 2020a).

Such bad behavior shows that abuse of power is still ongoing and getting worse. Because of weak law enforcement in solving cases of politicians of state officials involved in corruption, lightening court decisions causes many cases to be delayed in the prosecution process. This is an indication of weak law enforcement (Riyadi, Wibowo, & Susanti, 2020).

In particular case, dispute of right of individual property adopted individual and communal rights as well as self-government property rights are analyzed through strategic analysis theory and since it is related to public policy and ownership, hence another approach is through the public policy (Riyadi, 2017).

A case study analysis shows there has been an abuse of power against the authority of the state institution. It would be better for lawmakers to think about operational accountability that requires a check and balance system in law enforcement (Riyadi, Hermanto, Harlina, & Purnomo, 2020).

However, there are few literature references that discuss sustainable performance management. There needs to be more clarity between the theory of performance management and the theory of sustainable performance management that leads to development outcomes. The theory of sustainable performance management discusses the steps and strategies that public organizations must carry out. The existing literature needs to discuss whether

the process carried out by the government is continuous or not. It is necessary to examine the performance management implementation strategies that organizations need to do to achieve development outcomes.

Based on the differences above, previous research tends to manage problems in the implementation of the performance management system by enforcing the rules and standards stipulated in the laws and regulations. Following up previous study gap and the phenomena, this research analyzed a multi policies approach regarding the implementation of the performance management system and management of public service in Indonesia.

### **3. RESEARCH METHODS**

This research was conducted on a qualitative descriptive method. A qualitative research strategy can be applied if the research problems need to be explored deeper or followed up on previous quantitative research due to a previous theory or concept that is still considered unable to capture the complexity of the problem under study (Creswell, 2013). A qualitative research approach produces descriptive data in the form of words or writings and behaviors that can be observed from the subject and object of the study itself. The qualitative approach was chosen because it is in line with the aims of the research to describe and understand the phenomena, events, social activities, attitudes, beliefs, and perceptions of people (Creswell, 2013).

Data collection in this research were conducted through interviews, observation, and documentation. In-depth interview was conducted and performed to key informants. Participant observation was conducted by authors and team to obtain records in the field of study. Related documentation was gathered from many sources, such as internet media and library documents. Data were analyzed in 3 steps, which were data reduction, data display, and data verification referring to the interactive model. Data reduction is to sort out the main data, data display is to present the data, and data verification is to conclude the main themes of the results (Miles & Huberman, 1994).

Validity and reliability use triangulation based on the observation, in-depth interviews, and documentation analysis to obtain valid and reliable data coping credibility, transferability, auditability, and confirmability (Creswell, 2009). Credibility is related to the truth aspect by means of triangulation to compare the results of an interview with the results of interviews with colleagues. Transferability shows the applicability of research to other studies that readers can understand the results of qualitative research. The report is made in a detailed, clear, and systematic manner. Auditability means that it can be tested by examining the entire research process, since designing case studies, determining data sources, collecting data, analyzing data, making conclusions, can be traced, and showing the processes and results. Confirmability relates to the objectivity that the research results are agreed and accepted (Creswell, 2009).

### **4. LITERATURE REVIEW**

The development of public administration paradigm emphasizes the focus, locus, and value to be achieved. The classical bureaucracy focuses on organizational structure and management functions, locus focuses on the government bureaucracy and business organization, while values focus on efficiency, effectiveness, economical and rational. The neo-bureaucracy focuses on behavior-based decision-making processes, management, systems, and research, locus focuses on government bureaucratic decisions, and values focus on efficiency, effectiveness, economics and rationality. The institutions focus on understanding bureaucratic behavior and making decisions that are gradual and incremental in nature. The human relations, focus and locus on organization, as well as values are participation in decision making, minimization of differences, status, openness, self-actualization, and increased job satisfaction. The public choices focus on providing services to the community. Besides, the New Public Management (NPM) focuses on human values and social justice focuses on organizational design based on decentralization, democracy, responsiveness, participation, and providing services needed by the community (Frederickson, 1976).

The emergence of the New Public Management (NPM) paradigm in the early 1990s is an important momentum questioning the dominance of the government and providing space for the private sector to participate in public services. A new model in public policy is needed to improve the performance of public services with results-

oriented and competitive dynamics by changing the rules of the game and fostering creativity in providing services (Hood, 1991).

Public policy is a complex pattern of interdependence collective choices, including decisions to act made by government agencies or offices. Dunn argues that public policy is a series of actions that are determined and implemented or not carried out by the government that has a purpose or is oriented towards certain goals for the benefit of the whole community. The implications of this understanding are: the first form is the determination of government action, which is not only stated but also implemented in concrete form, based on certain goals and objectives, and is essentially intended for the benefit of the entire community. Public Policy analysis is an intellectual and practical activity aimed to create, critically assess, and communicate knowledge about and within the policy process. The policy analysis process has 5 interdependent stages that together form a complex and non-linear cycle of intellectual activity. These activities are sequential in time and are embedded in a policy process that is complex, non-linear, and essentially political (Dunn, 2012).

Based on the epistemological and sociological description of the public policy theory for refining the research, it can be stated that making multi-policies and regulations related with sustainable performance management of government institution is a part of public policy theory.

## 5. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Based on the data collection and data analysis, the results are as follows.

*"In terms of performance management, the Provincial Government has understood the Performance Accountability System for Government Agencies and their impact on government governance. Each Regional Government Organization has demonstrated performance by relying on the Performance Accountability System of Government Agencies, including performance integration, burden sharing of performance targets, tiered evaluation and performance report cards of Regional Government Organizations. This performance report card serves as an encouragement for the head of the Local Government Organization to manage its performance well." (Informant 1, 2021).*

Based on the results of the interview, the Provincial Government confirms on matters analyzed in terms of Bureaucratic Reform, Accountability and Supervision that the Provincial Government developed and cultivated an effective implementation of performance measures. The performance measurement at the Provincial Government level has met all the criteria set, while for the Regional Government Organization level, the conformity level was above 75% but had yet reached 100%. Several problems related to this condition were: a. not all performance was in line with the main performance indicators at the provincial government level; b. performance indicators have been compiled in stages, but not all of them are the result of the main performance indicators of the organization; c. most of the performance data set forth in the action plan was collected on a regular basis.

*"every money spent must be able to provide benefits for the prosperity of regional residents so that regional apparatus organizations must submit budget proposals, so that I can check the logical framework, whether the strategic objectives are in accordance with the proposed budget needs" (Informant 2, 2021).*

Based on the results of the interview above, the regional apparatus organizations related to the use of performance measurement: a. have compiled key performance indicators, but have not used them to prepare planning, budgeting, or performance appraisal documents; b. did not monitor all performance targets for their performance achievements, especially the implementation of the performance of activities and sub-activities; c. only 40% to 75% conducted periodic reviews to ensure it remained relevant to the core in the face of changing conditions; d. only utilized 40% to 75% of the information generated from performance measurement on the action plan to take corrective steps in the future.

*"We, as Heads of Regional Apparatus Organizations, benefit greatly from this Governor Regulation. We do not need to formulate what programs and activities will be proposed. The programs and activities are quite clear. We*

*must formulate a logical framework that is relevant to the strategic goals that have been set and with whom we must coordinate, no more hesitation.” (Informant 3, 2021).*

Based on the results of the interview above, the Governor's Regulation greatly facilitated the preparation of various programs and activities relevant to the achievement of regional development strategic targets. This policy allowed for the development of a clear program logic framework describing what activities and stages must be carried out and understands what to do in relation to achieving strategic goals. The ease of coordination was greatly supported by the Governor's Instruction. In terms of preparing Human Resources who must carry out performance management, it was agreed that the various policies set by the Provincial Government provided convenience and clear work directions required in the preparation of programs and activities providing convenience because they prioritized the business processes actually being faced. The provincial performance quality was considered to be better than the Strategic Plan. Some strategic planning criteria that have not been fully met were the determination of performance targets, alignment between strategic goals and programs and activities, and alignment between strategic plans and important conditions, however, the assessment meant that it had met more than 75% of the criteria but had not met 100% of the criteria.

*“In general, the results of the provincial performance evaluation show positive results. This occurs due to incentives or rewards given by the leadership and regional heads to organizations that are able to exceed performance targets. Thus, employees are motivated to always improve their performance and have an impact on organizational performance” (Informant 4, 2021).*

The only condition that did not meet the criteria was the use of the evaluation results for improvement of work programs in the future. The evaluation results were not followed up for program improvement because the quality of the evaluation results was not optimal or did not allow for improvement. However, this condition only had a small percentage, which was about 10% to 25% of the total. One of the main aspects of implementing performance management was integrating performance evaluation with the remuneration obtained by employees. There was still no policy that specifically regulated remuneration with the performance achieved by the organization and individual employees. Additional income allowances were given to provincial government officials with varying amounts according to their level of position. The amount of this allowance was influenced by the level of attendance of the employee concerned. Individual performance evaluation of the apparatus was carried out on an annual basis in order to assess the Employee's Work Targets, while monthly or quarterly periodic evaluations were not carried out. The results of the research indicated that there had not been an alignment between the performance formulation at the organizational level and the performance formulation at the individual level. Although the performance indicators had been determined through the governor's regulation regulating the organizational structure and work procedures, this performance formulation was not always translated into the performance formulation in the Employee Work Targets. The performance formulation within contained more activities carried out by the employee concerned. The evaluation of the Employee's Work Targets was carried out in relation to the implementation of activities and activities that had been targeted. The results of the evaluation did not affect the amount of additional income received by employees but affected the general assessment of employees, such as promotions.

From an organizational perspective, Control and Evaluation of Development Programs had been considered to reflect organizational performance on a quarterly basis. However, it was not intended to provide incentives or rewards for organizations that succeed in achieving the expected performance. This control and evaluation was more aimed to make improvement efforts for the next period, which are considered to have achieved the highest and lowest performance. The more effective the control and evaluation of performance, the less potential there was for budget waste and programs that are not on target. Some of the obstacles that occurred regarding budget waste and programs that were not on target were the inability to evaluate and assess performance. If this condition is persistent and frequent, then government performance becomes ineffective and inefficient. In addition, control and performance evaluation can map the risks that occur as a result of implementing a policy.

Based on the results of observations on the implementation of performance management in the Provincial

Government, there were no explicit policies related to risk management. However, this risk management factor had become the concern of the Provincial Government into two parts, namely the first was the risk to ensure the implementation of the Performance Accountability System for Government Agencies as the implementation of public sector performance management in Indonesia and the second was the risk management to minimize the possibility of failure in achieving various strategic targets.

The operational dimension of implementing sustainable performance management is the ability to develop an integrated performance plan. Integrated performance planning is an effort to ensure that the achievement of development goals is carried out jointly between existing units and ensures that there is continuity between planning and budgeting. This integration is interpreted as horizontal integration between work units in achieving common goals and vertical integration to ensure planning, budgeting and implementation are in harmony. From a policy perspective, there have been policies that encourage horizontal and vertical integration. The achievement of strategic targets at the provincial government level is included in the program's strategic targets, which is a governor's regulation that aligns strategic objectives with operational plans and the implementation of activities that bridge the budgeting mechanism.

In order to operationalize the implementation of performance management in the Provincial Government, information technology was used, namely the e-system. This application was used to present planning, budgeting, implementation, and monitoring. With this application, the planning process could be monitored since the planning proposal. The results of the deliberation on development plans were contained in this application to determine the location, implementation time, expected outcomes, and linkages with relevant strategic targets. This application also provided directions for the description of performance starting from the expected strategic goals, programs and related activities, and sub-activities. This application also contained an Operational Plan for the Implementation of Activities in detail containing the various stages of activities, the mechanism for implementing the activities, the timing of the activities, the person in charge of the activities and the parties associated with these activities. The Operational Plan for the Implementation of the Activities could be assessed for risk factors related to the activity as well as the risk management plan by the person in charge of the activity to minimize the possibility of such risk occurring. The application was used by the performance control team to monitor the progress of related performance. Each performance manager submitted their completed performance activities into this application. Each superior supervised the implementation of the performance, gave approval, provided input and direction for performance improvement. This application generated performance information which would be summarized in the performance report. The application was also used by the Provincial Inspectorate in order to carry out supervision. This application provided the content needed to conduct risk management-based monitoring. Performance evaluation was also easier if it was done using the application.

The provincial government had implemented the performance management implementation. It had a set of performance measures at the provincial government level as well as regional apparatus organizations and it also had quality. In several regional apparatus organizations, performance measures as output were still found. In relation to the integrated performance planning, there were differences in its application to provincial governments. The integration of planning started from the preparation, which was then continued with a strategic map, which then became a reference for regional apparatus organizations in formulating strategic plans and activities. The Provincial Government developed performance architecture and underlying business processes. This performance architecture would ensure the alignment of performance planning from the provincial government level to the activities and sub-activities that existed in each regional apparatus organization. There was no specific mechanism to ensure the alignment of planning from the provincial government level to the activities in each regional apparatus organization. The preparation of strategic plans and activities was still guided by the medium-term plan by providing creative freedom in each regional apparatus organization. Regarding performance evaluation indicators, the provincial government had conducted periodic performance evaluations that described the performance progress made by each regional apparatus organization in achieving the targets set. The governor directly led the implementation of the submission of work results reports and gave appreciation to the outstanding regional apparatus organizations. Performance evaluation could also take advantage of information technology. Each performance achievement in each regional apparatus organization was presented in a real-time information

system and was used as a dashboard for the Governor to assess the performance of regional and individual organizations. Performance evaluation in the Provincial Government was also carried out by the Provincial Inspectorate using a performance accountability evaluation mechanism.

The implementation of performance management in the form of a Performance Accountability System for Government Agencies in Yogyakarta, West Java, and South Sumatra used a different approach. The Provincial Government of the Special Region of Yogyakarta used a rule-based approach by implementing various additional policies to ensure the effectiveness of the implementation of sustainable performance management. The West Java Provincial Government used an information technology approach to implement sustainable performance management. The South Sumatra Provincial Government only used a policy approach set by the central government in the implementation of performance management.

An organization will be able to implement performance management in a sustainable manner if it meets the aspects of operational, institutional, and value dimensions interconnected with each other. The operational dimension focuses on the availability of various procedures and means of performance management in each organizational unit, such as integrated performance planning, determination of performance measures, implementation of performance evaluations, the relationship between performance management and performance allowances, to the ability to implement risk management. The value dimension relates to the leadership's commitment in determining the direction of performance management development and internalization of values and work culture in the organization. The institutional dimension is a key factor in the implementation of sustainable performance management because it is binding in performance management practices.

Based on several results above, it was known that the problem had not been well regulated. Public policy as a series of actions and implementation by the government has orientation towards certain goals for the benefit of the whole community. Public policy automatically regulates all matters concerning the affairs of all levels of society. It is an important stage, no matter how good the public policy made, it will be useless if there is no effort to implement it because it cannot bring the desired goals. If the policy is not implemented effectively, policymakers' decisions will not be implemented successfully.

## CONCLUSIONS

Based on the analysis and discussion of the research results above, it can be concluded that the implementation of sustainable performance management of government institution policy required power balance, which is important in reaching the effectiveness of policy implementation. It is important to prioritize the collaboration between government, community, private sector, and stakeholders, to reach the best of sustainable performance management policy. There are several variables that influence the success of a policy implementation, such as policy standards, policy objectives, resources, characteristics of organizations, attitudes of implementers, communication, and the social, economic, and political environment.

It is suggested that the legislative and executive, as the public officials making multi-policies and regulations regarding sustainable performance management policy, must be involved and implied for revising regulations on sustainable performance management policy in Indonesia. The related institutions as the public officials in making regulations should conduct sustainable performance management policies in Indonesia to improve multi-regulation and cover the sustainable performance management.

## REFERENCES

- [1] Agasisti, T., Agostino, D., & Soncin, M. (2020). Implementing Performance Measurement Systems in Local Governments: Moving from the "How" to the "Why." *Public Performance and Management Review*, 43(5), 1100–1128. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15309576.2019.1700806>
- [2] Bouloiz, H. (2020). Sustainable performance management using resilience engineering. *International Journal of Engineering Business Management*, 12. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1847979020976205>
- [3] Choi, I., & Moynihan, D. (2019). How to foster collaborative performance management? Key factors in the US federal agencies. *Public Management Review*, 21(10), 1538–1559. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14719037.2019.1571275>

- [4] Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches* (3rd ed.). California, Thousand Oaks: Sage Publication.
- [5] Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches* (3rd ed.). California, Thousand Oaks: Sage Publication.
- [6] Dunn, W. (2012). *Public Policy Analysis (Fifth)*. Upper Sadle: Pearson Education Inc.
- [7] Fechete, F., & Nedelcu, A. (2019). Performance management assessment model for sustainable development. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 11(10). <https://doi.org/10.3390/su11102779>
- [8] Frederickson, H. G. (1976). The lineage of new public administration. *Administration & Society*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/009539977600800202>
- [9] Hendriarti, S. F., Othman, N. A., Arif, S. B., Assery, S., & Jamal, F. N. (2022). Talent Management Analysis of Indonesian Civil Advocates. *Journal of Positive School Psychology*, 6(2), 1106–1116.
- [10] Hood, C. (1991). All Seasons? the Rise of New Public Management (Npm). *Public Administration*.
- [11] Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis*. California, Thousand Oaks: Sage Publication.
- [12] Nuraini, N., Saleh, C., Wike, W., & Riyadi, B. S. (2023). The Relationship of Community Empowerment and Social Capital towards Production Capacity of Agricultural Product in Indonesia. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(3 SE-), 435–448. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i3.1552>
- [13] Park, A. Y. S., & Krause, R. M. (2021). Exploring the landscape of sustainability performance management systems in U.S. local governments. *Journal of Environmental Management*, 279. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2020.111764>
- [14] Priyambodo, J. B., Wijaya, A. F., Wike, Sujarwoto, & Riyadi, B. S. (2023a). Implementation of Performance Accountability System for Government Institution: A Case Study in Indonesia. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(2 SE-), 522–531. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i2.1288>
- [15] Priyambodo, J. B., Wijaya, A. F., Wike, Sujarwoto, & Riyadi, B. S. (2023b). The Analysis of Performance Accountability System for Government Agency: A Punishment Theory Perspective. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(2 SE-), 532–541. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i2.1289>
- [16] Purbiyantari, W., Zauhar, S., Suryadi, Hermawan, R., & Riyadi, B. S. (2023a). Leadership and Service in the Police Context\_A Qualitative Study. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(2 SE-), 846–856. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i2.1390>
- [17] Purbiyantari, W., Zauhar, S., Suryadi, Hermawan, R., & Riyadi, B. S. (2023b). Transformational Leadership, Technology Adoption, and Public Service towards Job Competency. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(2 SE-), 835–845. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i2.1389>
- [18] Riyadi, B. S. (2017). Law of agrarian conflict and resolution effort: A claim dispute of Eigendom verponding Land. *International Journal of Law*, 3(80), 88. Retrieved from [www.lawjournals.org](http://www.lawjournals.org)
- [19] Riyadi, B. S. (2020a). Culture of abuse of power due to conflict of interest to corruption for too long on the management form resources of oil and gas in Indonesia. *International Journal of Criminology and Sociology*, 9(61), 247–254. <https://doi.org/10.6000/1929-4409.2020.09.23>
- [20] Riyadi, B. S. (2020b). Culture of abuse of power in indonesia from the perspective of criminology and law. *International Journal of Criminology and Sociology*, 9(2008), 274–284. <https://doi.org/10.6000/1929-4409.2020.09.26>
- [21] Riyadi, B. S., Hermanto, A. B., Harlina, I., & Purnomo, H. (2020). Discretion of power of the indonesian national police impacts the abuse of power in the case of letter forgery of red notice "Fugitive Djoko Tjandra." *International Journal of Criminology and Sociology*, 9(October), 1292–1300. <https://doi.org/10.6000/1929-4409.2020.09.148>
- [22] Riyadi, B. S., Wibowo, B. R., & Susanti, V. (2020). Culture of corruption politicians' behavior in parliament and state official during reform government Indonesia. *International Journal of Criminology and Sociology*, 9, 52–62. <https://doi.org/10.6000/1929-4409.2020.09.06>
- [23] Rozikin, M., Sulisty, A. B., Saleh, C., Hermawan, H., & Riyadi, B. S. (2023). The Collaborative Governance in Digital Infrastructure Development in Indonesia: A Public Policy Perspective. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(3 SE-), 449–459. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i3.1553>
- [24] Rozikin, M., Wijaya, A. F., & Riyadi, B. S. (2023). Sustainable Development: Disaster Risk Reduction of Forest and Land Fire in Indonesia. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(3 SE-), 329–339. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i3.1538>
- [25] Sinulingga, M., Pantja Djati, SuyonoThamrin, Harlina Juni Risma Saragi, Bambang Slamet Riyadi, & Tri Ubayanto. (2023). Antecedents and Consequences of Smart Management Information System for Supervision to Improve Organizational Performance. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(2 SE-), 816–824. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i2.1262>
- [26] Sipayung, A., Sumartono, S., Saleh, C., Rozikin, M., & Riyadi, B. S. (2023a). Implementation of Deradicalization Policy to Reduce Criminal Acts of Terrorism. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(3 SE-), 576–589. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i3.1574>
- [27] Sipayung, A., Sumartono, S., Saleh, C., Rozikin, M., & Riyadi, B. S. (2023b). The Relationship between Content of Policy and Context of Implementation towards the Deradicalization Program Mediated by Collaborative Governance: A Proposed Model. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(3 SE-), 590–606. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i3.1575>
- [28] Solong, H. A. (2017). Actualization New Public Service Administration in Public Service. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, 7(3), 505–513.
- [29] Susilo, H., Astuti, E. S., Arifin, Z., Mawardi, M. K., & Riyadi, B. S. (2023). The Antecedents of Innovative Work Behavior in Village Owned Enterprises at East Java Indonesia. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(2 SE-), 879–891. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i2.1318>

- [30] Syahrudin, Wijaya, A. F., Suryono, A., & Riyadi, B. S. (2023). A Qualitative Study : Critical Success Factors of Public Private Partnerships in Indonesia. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(2 SE-), 511–521. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i2.1263>
- [31] Tjahjono, B., Suryono, A., Riyanto, R., Amin, F., & Riyadi, B. S. (2023). The Dynamics and Governance of Civil-Military Collaboration on Disaster Management in Indonesia. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(2 SE-), 825–834. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i2.1363>
- [32] Toruan, T. S. L., Gusti, D. P., & Riyadi, B. S. (2023). Human Resource Management of the Army Program in Indonesia. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(2 SE-), 808–815. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i2.1261>
- [33] Toruan, T. S. L., Riyadi, B. S., & Gusti, D. P. (2023). Conflict Management and Strategy Management at the State Borders of Indonesia. *International Journal of Membrane Science and Technology*, 10(3 SE-), 319–328. <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i3.1537>
- [34] Tseng, S. T., & Levy, P. E. (2019). A multilevel leadership process framework of performance management. *Human Resource Management Review*, 29(4). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.hrmr.2018.10.001>
- [35] Khan, S., Jam, F. A., Shahbaz, M., & Mamun, M. A. (2018). Electricity consumption, economic growth and trade openness in Kazakhstan: evidence from cointegration and causality. *OPEC Energy Review*, 42(3), 224-243.
- [36] Shahbaz, M., Sherafatian-Jahromi, R., Malik, M. N., Shabbir, M. S., & Jam, F. A. (2016). Linkages between defense spending and income inequality in Iran. *Quality & Quantity*, 50(3), 1317-1332.
- [37] Jam, F. A., Akhtar, S., Haq, I. U., Ahmad-U-Rehman, M., & Hijazi, S. T. (2010). Impact of leader behavior on employee job stress: evidence from Pakistan. *European Journal of Economics, Finance and Administrative Sciences*, (21), 172-179.

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.15379/ijmst.v10i3.1648>

This is an open access article licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/>), which permits unrestricted, non-commercial use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the work is properly cited.